# 33 RD ANNUAL BYZANTINE STUDIES CONFERENCE

University of Toronto October 11–14 2007



**ABSTRACTS** 

The Byzantine Studies Conference is an annual forum for the presentation and discussion of papers embodying current research on all aspects of Byzantine history and culture. The Abstracts of Papers is produced from electronic copies supplied by the speakers. Copyright © is reserved by the individual speakers.

Copies of the Abstracts are available for purchase. Subscriptions for Series 7 nos. 31-35, 2005-2009 are available for \$60 a set. All prices include postage. Orders must be prepaid in U.S. currency. Make checks payable to Byzantine Studies Conference and send orders to:

Prof. Anna Gonosová Department of Art History University of California, Irvine Irvine, CA 92717-2785

For questions about orders of the Abstracts e-mail Anna Gonosová at: agonosov@uci.edu

Byzantine Studies Conference Abstracts of Papers—Byzantine Studies Conference, 1st 1975-Madison, WI [etc.]

Key title: Abstracts of Papers—Byzantine Studies Conference ISSN 0147-3387
I.Byzantine Empire—Congresses
DF501.5b9a 949.5 77-79346
Library of Congress MARC-S

Cover: Cart Amulet, bronze, Early Christian/Byzantine. University of Toronto, Malcove Collection, M82.387, Cat. 107.



#### **Donors**

University of Toronto:
Office of the Dean, Faculty of Arts and Science
Department of Classics,
Canada Research Chair cluster "Transitions in Ancient Thought"
Department of Art
Office of the Dean, Faculty of Music
Centre for Medieval Studies
Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies
University of Toronto Art Centre

Carleton University:
Office of the Dean, Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences

York University:
Programme in Hellenic Studies
Graduate Program in Art History
Program in Classical Studies

University of Ottawa:
Department of Classics and Religious Studies

Royal Ontario Museum

A.G. Leventis Foundation

Hellenic Heritage Foundation

Krinos Foods Canada Ltd.

Consulate General of Greece in Toronto

Consulate General of the Republic of Cyprus

Suna and Inan Kıraç Foundation, Istanbul Research Institute

Soundstreams Canada

## **INDEX of SESSIONS**

Session I: Seventh-Century Affairs - VIC 112	3
Session II: History - VIC 213	7
Session III: Late Antiquity - VIC 112	10
Session IV: Text's Work - VIC 213	12
Session V: Transitions from the Ancient World - VIC 213	23
Session VI: Death and Memory - VIC 112	27
Session VII: Byzantino-Serbian Culture - VIC 112	31
Session VIII: Theology and Council - VIC 213	37
Session VIX: Cyprus: Archaeology, Architecture and History - VIC 112	43
Session X: Art History - VIC 115	47
Session XI: Monasticism and Messianism - VIC 112	51
Session XII: Identity and Art - VIC 115	56
Session XIII: Saints - VIC 112	61
Session XIV: Archaeology in Turkey - VIC 115	65

Session XV: Islamic Context and Contacts - VIC 112	69
Session XVI: Lingering Byzantium - VIC 115	73
Session XVII: Power and Representation in Late Antiquity - VIC 112	78
Session XVIII: Constantinople - VIC 115	83
Session XIX: Architecture - VIC 112	88
Session XX: Icons - VIC 115	93

## **SESSION I**

Chair: John Haldon Princeton University

## Seventh-Century Affairs - VIC 112

Walter E. Kaegi *University of Chicago*Controversies about Constans II

David Olster

University of Kentucky

Justinian II's Silention and Imperial Authority in the Church

Glenn Groves

University of Kentucky

The "Images" Canons of the Council in Trullo

#### Controversies about Constans II

#### Walter E. Kaegi University of Chicago

I investigate and reflect on the present state of some scholarly controversies about Emperor Constans II. Debate has intensified concerning Constans II. New perspectives and hypotheses have emerged, without achieving any scholarly consensus. It is desirable to venture some attempt at updating historical scholarship. I do not attempt any comprehensive review of themal genesis, but military structures and military finance receive some reinterpretation. In particular, I discuss issues concerning his putative military and other reforms in Asia Minor and North Africa, especially in the late 640s, 650s (most notably after 659), and 660s. Among others I take into account the latest scholarship and hypotheses of C. Zuckerman, W. Brandes, J.-C. Cheynet, S. Cosentino, T. Greenwood, W. Treadgold. I use narrative sources in Arabic as well as Greek, and sigillographic evidence. This has implications for the interpretation of the fundamental developments of the seventh century. Political, ecclesiastical and military resistance to imperial policies took a number of forms, in terms of the writing and dissemination of hagiographic accounts as well as grumbling and open clashes with the secular authorities. All of that troubled and even poisoned the atmosphere in Africa and elsewhere on the eve of and during the Muslim conquests. The continuing imperial need to confiscate or borrow church plate and other portable ecclesiastical wealth in the reign of Constans II, as reported by the *Liber Pontificalis*, suggests that Constans II and his advisors had not solved the problem of military financing by the time of his voyage to Italy and Sicily in 663. The persisting complaints about confiscations of church plate are indirect and circumstantial evidence that no major reform of Byzantine military finances had taken place in the west. The ability of Mu'awiya to escalate invasions of Anatolia to include winter raids after 663 suggests that no satisfactory system of new Byzantine military reform including finance had developed securely in the east (Anatolia) either. Exactly what Constans II was doing in the west is important but remains disputed. But there are new developments that deserve notice. Recent non-literary evidence from North Africa, from the provinces of Byzacena and Numidia, indicate that the military office of Magister Militum apparently persisted in those provinces at least until 670. The survival of the office of Magister Militum in North Africa beyond the decease of Constans II indicates that emperor had not succeeded in implementing radically new military reforms in North Africa. This in no way contradicts accounts that he undertook controversial revenue-raising measures. His ultimate intentions remain opaque, even though his fiscal policies aroused bitter opposition. Some of the titulature for military commanders remains very traditional even in the seventh decade of the seventh century. Whether traditional titulature masks changes in underlying realities is another matter.

#### JUSTINIAN II'S Silention AND IMPERIAL AUTHORITY IN THE CHURCH

#### David Olster University of Kentucky

The state of our sources dictates that any conclusions about the reign of Justinian II must be tentative, and any about his ecclesiastical policies extremely so. The sources are poor, the chronology vague and uncertain, and the events themselves unclear. In this brief presentation, I wish only to make some modest remarks about an unusual, but rather undervalued contemporary document most central to Justinian's ecclesiastical policies: a Latin translation of a letter ascribed to Justinian dating to 687. My hope is to illustrate through the analysis of this document how Justinian attempted by ritual presentation to enhance his authority within the church.

The brief letter—less than fifty lines—of Justinian II to Pope John V is a rather odd text. In it, Justinian notifies the Pope that he has discovered irregularities in the handling of the Sixth Ecumenical Council Acts because certain *iudices* had in their possession copies of the Sixth Ecumenical Council Acts without his permission. He therefore convened a meeting of the ecclesiastical and secular officials, including the Papal representative in Constantinople, to certify the Acts. As the only extant, official chancery document between Constantine IV and the *Ekloga*, the letter's significance transcends its somewhat mundane subject. As Heinz Ohme has pointed out, the *iussio* is a surprisingly valuable source that offers both the first substantial evidence of the thematic structure and a unique opportunity to examine Justinian's rhetorical construction of church-state relations. Surprisingly, what has not been considered is how this document illustrates a new ritual expression of the conventional rhetoric of emperor and church.

Justinian exploited the ritual convocation of the *silention* to present the Council Acts as imperial law, and thus, by implication, subsumed church doctrine within his direct sphere of authority. This policy direction finds fuller expression in the Quinisext Council canon that confirmed Justinian's "traditional" status as a deacon: a status that was not at all traditional. Such claims of ecclesiastical status and authority appear particularly significant when, in the succeeding generation, Leo III took it upon himself to define Christian worship without benefit of a synod or council. Indeed, it is worth noting that Germanos's initial objection to Leo's iconoclasm was not to defend icons, but to request a council since he claimed that the emperor had overstepped the bounds of his authority. I would like to suggest that the ritual presentation of Justinian II was a step in the process of imperial claims of ecclesiastical authority leading up to iconoclasm, and that to understand the origins of iconoclasm we must look to the evolution of the imperial office and its relationship to ecclesiastical authority.

#### THE "IMAGES" CANONS OF THE COUNCIL IN TRULLO

#### Glenn Groves University of Kentucky

This paper attempts to revise the viewpoint of most scholarship since Ernst Kitzinger's seminal article "The Cult of Images Before Iconoclasm" that has judged the Quinisext Council canons on images only through the succeeding generation's controversy over icons. The brilliance of Kitzinger's article notwithstanding, modern scholarship has anachronistically read these canons (73, 82, and 100) as evidence for an event that had not yet happened: in essence, reading the issues of the 720s into the 690s. Instead, this paper suggests that however relevant these canons are to iconoclasm, the authors of the canons themselves would necessarily be unaware of the controversy, and might have had other motivations than clarifying or establishing a theology of images. This paper argues that the famous "art" canons must be examined so that knowledge of the future is not assumed.

Further, the canons, as ecclesiastical literature, have been traditionally understood only in their ecclesiastical applicability. What has been insufficiently considered, the paper suggests, is reading such texts within a broader socio-cultural and political context, as well as the accepted ecclesiastical context. The primarily theological language of the canons is rhetorically appropriate, but the cultural significance extends well beyond the ecclesiastical sphere. The canons demonstrate how the political discourse of the seventh century had adopted theological rhetorical forms. Therefore, these canons must be understood both in terms of Christian practice and also how such practice was informed by a larger socio-political context. This rhetoric should be seen for what it signifies culturally, rather than limiting its significance to religion. The paper argues that this rhetorical language was instead fundamentally part of the Byzantine political and religious culture, and therefore reflects contemporary cultural concerns rather than reflecting the future controversy over icons.

This paper suggests a contextual explanation why the formulators of the canons might have preferred to use the human figure of Christ instead of the Lamb, which is expressly forbidden by canon 82. The emphasis on the human Christ rather than the symbolic, this paper argues, might be intended to assimilate the humiliated Christ with the humiliated Empire, whose triumphalist image had been shattered. The rehabilitation of this triumphalism required a method by which the human figure of the emperor could be more closely associated with Christ, a method found in the Apocalypse of Pseudo-Methodius. There, the complementary association of divine and mundane rulers forms an integral part of the eschatological drama that will eventually result in a glorious victory for the Emperor, Christ and Christianity over the Arabs and the anti-Christ. This association of Empire, emperor and Christ fits, the paper argues, the late seventh-century context of the canons better than the dominant interpretation of these canons as merely the first act of the iconoclast controversy. Without doubt, the canons dealing with religious images are relevant to the study of iconoclasm, but it is also necessary to consider them in their own context, rather than in the light of iconoclasm.

## **SESSION II**

Chair: Tia Kolbaba Rutgers University

## History - VIC 213

Margaret Trenchard-Smith

Loyola Marymount University

Barking at the Cross: A Curious Incident from the So-called Chronicle of Zachariah of Mytilene

George A. Bevan *Queen's University*The Adultery of Eudocia Reconsidered

Daniel Sarefield Fitchburg State College Book Burning in the Byzantine Empire

Meredith L. D. Riedel *University of Oxford*The Role of Ideology in the Morale of the Middle Byzantine Army

# BARKING AT THE CROSS: A CURIOUS INCIDENT FROM THE SO-CALLED CHRONICLE OF ZACHARIAH OF MYTILENE

# Margaret Trenchard-Smith Loyola Marymount University

In the year 518, according to the non-Chalcedonian Syriac source attributed to Zachariah of Mytilene, a curious incident is related wherein a crowd of "Egyptians and Alexandrians and men from beyond the Jordan, Edomites and Arabians" (trans. E. W. Brooks and F. J. Hamilton), in Jerusalem to attend the festival of the dedication of the Cross, become possessed by demons and bark at the Cross.

This is an account rich in significance for the history of unreason in the Byzantine Empire. Putting aside the consideration that this event may have been wholly fabricated, what did it mean, to the non-Chalcedonian faithful who read this or heard of it, that these persons had "barked" at the Cross? Initially, according to Pseudo-Zachariah, it perplexed them. For humans to utter the cries of beasts signified demonic possession, heresy and madness. Worse, this was mass possession, on the part of non-Chalcedonians. Pseudo-Zachariah reports that this troubled the "prudent" until it became clear to them that God had used this means to test the faithful and to foreshadow the internal strife over the Faith which would follow the death of the emperor Anastasios.

Two features of the author's interpretation of this event and its aftermath are particularly of note. The first is the belief that demoniacs can be acutely sensitive to the holy, as here, in the presence of the Cross. The second, that God might choose to permit demons to possess human beings for His own, often inscrutable, purposes. Demonological beliefs in this opaque, "complex and composite" Syriac source of uncertain genre (Marina Greatrex) are in keeping with those found in contemporary Greek sources, and would later be fully developed in Byzantine hagiography.

This episode is polysemic in the extreme. In this paper, Pseudo-Zachariah's text is compared to related evidence from medical literature, canon law and hagiography pertaining to zoomorphic behavior in the mad and possessed, to mass possession, and to the peculiar "talents" of demoniacs, so that the spectrum of possible interpretations of this affair might be revealed. One conclusion may be given at the outset: one who had gone "barking mad" had not necessarily gone to the dogs.

#### THE ADULTERY OF EUDOCIA RECONSIDERED

George A. Bevan Queen's University

The alleged infidelity of the *augusta* Eudocia with the *magister officiorum* Paulinus is conventionally used to explain her permanent estrangement from the court in Constantinople, and from her husband Theodosius II. The chronicle of John Malalas is commonly adduced in support of this argument. But Malalas does not confirm that any adultery actually took place, and instead adds folkloric embellishments to the story that only highlight the injustice of the emperor's suspicions about his wife's fidelity. The well-known story of the Phrygian apple given first to the emperor, from the emperor to Eudocia, from Eudocia to Paulinus, and from the unwitting Paulinus back to the emperor, seems awkwardly imposed by Malalas on a situation that involved no wrongdoing at all. When combined with the documented removal of Paulinus shortly before Eudocia's departure, scholars have seen in the story of the apple an anodyne attempt at concealing the empress's adultery.

To get behind Malalas's sixth-century account one needs to examine earlier stories of sexual impropriety in the court of Theodosius II. The *Liber Heraclidis* of the exiled bishop Nestorius of Constantinople implies strongly that Pulcheria broke her vows of virginity by consorting with men. In the inauthentic final *vaticinum ex eventu* of the *Liber* Nestorius is said to prophesy that the emperor would witness an "empress cast down the empress with insult and contumely," by "the demon, the chief of adultery." Yet the Syriac text does not specify whether Eudocia or Pulcheria is meant, although most scholars, on the strength of Malalas, have opted for the former. Given the earlier statements of Nestorius, the latter is surely to be understood. The next earliest source to talk of the adultery of an *augusta*, the anti-Chalcedonian *Vita* of Dioscorus of Alexandria, picks up the gossip about Pulcheria and in fact gives a version of the apple story (a century before Malalas) in which the empress has been caught in her love for the future emperor Marcian.

It is the role cast for Pulcheria as a defender of Chalcedonian orthodoxy that caused the salacious stories about her—whether true or false—to be transferred to Eudocia, whose permanent departure from the court and her subsequent patronage of anti-Chalcedonian monks and clerics in Palestine made her an easy target. That Pulcheria actually committed the acts imputed to her in the Nestorius *Liber Heraclidis* or the *Vita* of Dioscorus is doubtful. Both sources, however, confirm that the earliest stories of adultery concerned Pulcheria, not Eudocia. We must, consequently, look for other reasons for the condemnation of Paulinus and the departure of Eudocia from Constantinople.

#### BOOK BURNING IN THE BYZANTINE EMPIRE

#### Daniel Sarefield Fitchburg State College

The early Byzantine period is the very age when book burning seems to have been a more frequent, sustained, and conspicuous feature of religious conflict and repression than at any other time in the history of western Eurasia. Between the accession of Constantine I and the death of Justinian I, censured writings were destroyed by fire on more than forty separate occasions. At one time or another, these book burnings consumed nearly every conceivable sort of religious composition, including the works of Christians, anti-Christian writers, Manichaeans, practitioners of sorcery, astrology, prophecy, and divination, Christian heretics and schismatics, and many others. Books and other writings were condemned and burned by synods, destroyed in bonfires arising from local conflicts or disturbances, and set ablaze publicly as part of individual demonstrations of sincere religious conversion. The range and scope of these many destructions attest to the significance of book burning, which was by then a venerable ancient practice. Book burning developed during Greek and Roman antiquity. Kings and magistrates of the Hellenistic world and Republican Rome first authorized the public incineration of written works on the grounds that they were a source of pollution harmful to the pax deorum. Their successors, the Roman emperors, continued to burn books in much the same manner well into the Christian period. Throughout these episodes, book burnings were not simply events where forbidden writings were destroyed by fire, but rather they were rituals and spectacles that conveyed explicit social, religious, and ideological messages to multiple audiences. During the later Roman Empire, as book burning came to be employed by an ever-growing circle of practitioners, including not only the emperors and their appointed representatives but also pagan priests, bishops, holy men, and even pious laypersons, the practice came to express a variety of messages about worldly power and religious belief and to make a genuine impact on the religious life of that age.

Yet, in the centuries that followed, book burning seems to recede from the center of religious conflict. To be sure, book burnings occurred throughout later Byzantine history, such as in the context of the Iconoclastic controversy, following the condemnation of John Italos, and in relation to the suppression of Paulicians, Bogomils, Jews, and other dissenters. However, the prominence of book burning in these episodes diminished markedly and the variety of persons deploying it narrowed in contrast with earlier precedents. This paper examines these changes, elucidating the persistence of book burning in Byzantine society through the early thirteenth century, and highlighting the gradual changes that occurred within this time. As this paper makes plain, the Byzantines continued to burn books throughout the period and thereby carry on a practice passed on to them by their Roman and Christian predecessors, but over time they came to rely less on this activity in favor of other methods for denouncing and suppressing prohibited works. These differences highlight important changes occurring in the Byzantine world.

## THE ROLE OF IDEOLOGY IN THE MORALE OF THE MIDDLE BYZANTINE ARMY

# Meredith L. D. Riedel *University of Oxford*

Despite Hans-Georg Beck's description of Byzantium as "ein kriegsunwilliges Reich," Christianity and warfare were comfortably intertwined in the Roman concept of warfare in the middle Byzantine era. Religious justification for fighting, including the key aspect of financing, was delineated in Leo IV's *Taktika*. The night before battles, soldiers were to fast, take communion and pray, says the *Praecepta militaria*. Although the Byzantine cavalry advanced in an awe-inspiring and eerily silent formation, once battle was joined, Roman soldiers carried banners bearing the cross and shouted religious war cries prescribed by military handbooks. A tenth-century manual on skirmishing declares, "The outcome of war is not brought about according to the will of men but, just as the affairs of each one are weighted, by the providence (*pronoia*) of God on high." Among the spoils of battle, relics such as the Mandylion of Edessa or the hand of John the Baptist were brought back to Constantinople with great fanfare and celebrated for their powers as *palladia*. Even when prisoners were exchanged, the exchange was prefaced on both sides of the Lamos River by religious shouts to the deities of both faith traditions.

After the initial shock of the Islamic invasions of the seventh century, the Byzantine empire settled into a changed global situation, where Roman military might was no longer supreme. Most scholars have asserted that it was even weak, broken, or hovering on the edge of total defeat at the hands of the Muslim forces arrayed against it. However, Byzantium did not fall to the Arabs; indeed it continued to hold its seventh-century borders more or less stable for hundreds of years. This bespeaks an equilibrium not only of military strength but of the mobilizing force of religion that animated the conflict. The dominance of enacted theology was everywhere evident in Byzantine military life. Did faith constitute sufficient motivation to ensure loyal, disciplined service, or were soldiers concerned with more material matters? Moreover, what role did religious observance play in the execution of military duties? Did Nikephoros II Phokas's soldiers require the added prospect of martyrdom status to stiffen their resolve in the face of their Muslim opponents? If so, why? If not, why did he make the request?

Many scholars have contented themselves with merely noting Byzantium's religious context and cataloguing of the number of times *pronoia* is mentioned. However, even against the backdrop of ninth-century humanism (*pace* Lemerle) and tenth-century apocalyptic, an examination of the literary and sigillographic evidence for the Christian religion as it was experienced "on the ground" merits more attention. In a culture awash in relics, dream books, astrology, and belief in miraculous signs, why is it that more mundane expressions of Christian belief have been dismissed? The power of religious symbolism in the Byzantine military has, to some degree, been underestimated or misinterpreted as Crusade-like holy war.

## **SESSION III**

Chair: Geoffrey Greatrex *University of Ottawa* 

## Late Antiquity - VIC 112

Daniel Larison *University of Chicago*Constantinople Looking West: Monotheletism, Rome and the Heraclian Dynasty

Claudia Rapp
University of California, Los Angeles
Tangible Realities: Epigraphy and the Cult of Saints in Late Antiquity

Christopher Lillington-Martin *The Open University, UK*The Reconciliation of Procopius's Conflict Descriptions with Topography Near Rome

Jeremy Siemens *University of St. Michael's College* Cyril of Jerusalem and the Problem of Categories

#### Constantinople Looking West: Monotheletism, Rome and the Heraclian Dynasty

# Daniel Larison University of Chicago

Monotheletism, the seventh-century doctrine that Christ possessed only one, divine will, was neither a doctrine characterized by theological compromise with non-Chalcedonians nor was it primarily aimed at winning the support of non-Chalcedonians in the former provinces of the empire in the Near East. Standing in sharp conflict with prevailing interpretations of the political and theological purposes of monotheletism, this argument significantly supplements and revises the history of the official imperial adoption and condemnation of monotheletism. Further, it is not possible to understand the rise of monotheletism as the official doctrine of the empire without special emphasis on the role of Pope Honorius in suggesting the theological formula of one will in Christ to Patriarch Sergios. Because of the greater significance of the Roman church's involvement in inspiring and approving monothelete doctrine, it is necessary to reconsider and extensively modify the standard narrative about Byzantine religious developments in the seventh century and to reappraise the nature and goals of the political forces behind the adoption of monotheletism. Rather than a supposedly hopeless, last-ditch effort to rally non-Chalcedonian populations already lost to the empire, this paper proposes that the imperial adoption of monotheletism in the *Ekthesis* of 638 was the result of a Byzantine court that was looking west and concerned to secure the loyalties of subjects in Italy and North Africa.

The Heraclian dynasty did set Byzantine religious policy in the seventh century according to the perceived political needs of the empire, but throughout the century a consistent pattern emerges of the ecclesiastical and political authorities in Constantinople trying, not always successfully, to pursue close connections and good relations with the bishop of Rome. Recognition of this pro-papal tilt in Byzantine religious policy is essential to understanding the causes of both the official adoption and the condemnation of the doctrine of monotheletism. The evolution of the official doctrine from its promulgation in the *Ekthesis* of 638 to its eclipse in the *Typos* of 648 to its final condemnation at the sixth ecumenical council (680-681) was to a significant degree the product of Byzantine attempts to win papal approval and so shore up imperial control in the western provinces, which became all the more imperative after the massive losses of territory in Syria, Egypt and Palestine. While the Christological controversy of the seventh century has often been seen as a moment of profound alienation and opposition between east and west that presaged the later permanent divides between the sees of Constantinople and Rome, it is important to understand that the monothelete controversy derived in no small part from an ongoing Byzantine effort to satisfy Roman complaints and that the beginning of the controversy, like its end, was a Byzantine attempt to solidify links with the Roman church and the Latin west.

# Tangible Realities: Epigraphy and the Cult of Saints in Late Antiquity

#### Claudia Rapp University of California, Los Angeles

The rise of the cult of saints has often been explained as a post-Constantinian evolution of the cult of martyrs. Within this context, scholars—beginning with the Bollandists—have used tomb inscriptions to validate the veneration of specific martyrs and saints because they provide access to the tangible reality behind a cult.

This paper assembles, classifies and discusses the evidence for the interaction between hagiography and epigraphy in the third to seventh centuries. It begins by discussing the importance of epigraphy in the history of hagiographical scholarship. It then shows how epigraphy served as an inspiration to hagiographers in their writing. This is not only the case for funerary epigrams that gave rise to a cult (as did, for example, the *Vita of Aberkios*), but also extends to votive and donor inscriptions that were integrated into hagiographical writing. The *Vita of Daniel the Stylite* thus includes the dedicatory epigram that was engraved on his column. The opposite process could also apply, when an existing hagiographical record served as the basis for epigrams, as was the case with Sulpicius Severus's poems on Saint Felix that were inscribed in the saint's basilica in Nola. In a concluding section, I suggest that the connection between epigraphy and hagiography also extends to the stylistic level when expressions known from epigraphic language in praise of civic notables were adapted by hagiographers to extol the virtues of their saints.

This paper aims to insert Late Antique and early Byzantine hagiography firmly into the larger context of contemporary practices of literary composition and to place the nascent cult of the saints within its concrete historical context.

# THE RECONCILIATION OF PROCOPIUS'S CONFLICT DESCRIPTIONS WITH TOPOGRAPHY NEAR ROME

Christopher Lillington-Martin The Open University, UK

This paper investigates to what extent an analysis of Procopius's military literature describing conflicts can both inform, and be informed by, the analysis of the topography relating to conflict areas. A similar method has been applied to an eastern Byzantine conflict by me in "The Archaeological and Literary Evidence for a Battle near Dara, July AD 530: Topography, Text & Tactics" in *Congress Proceedings: Late Roman Army in the East, from Diocletian to the Arab Conquest*, University of Basilicata, May 2005, BAR International Series, Oxford (forthcoming). The objective of this paper is to advance our knowledge about conflicts which took place in Italy.

The main historical source is Procopius and the topographical information is obtained from cartography and satellite imagery and field visits to some of the sites. The historical source is used to identify topographic features of the conflict sites which are then located within the topography via satellite image and cartographic analysis. The accuracy, or otherwise, of the literary source is therefore tested against topography. This informs us as to the relative value of the literary source in conflict descriptions. Naturally, this value was influenced by Procopius's own sources and knowledge of the areas concerned. Ancient conflict eyewitnesses may be expected to provide more accurate information than others who relied solely on official reports or other witnesses. However, this is not necessarily the case and analysis of the topography indicates cases where the historical source, even if present at the conflict described, has left us a record that cannot be easily reconciled with the topography. This not only leads us to further question the source and the topography in order to reach a logical reconciliation, but also raises questions about the objectives of the source and the writer's attitude to his readers.

Once a logical reconciliation of the literary and topographical evidence has been achieved, as far as the evidence permits, it is then possible to reinterpret strategies and tactics in relation to topography. This permits a better analysis of a literary source, an improved historical assessment of events and therefore, to a certain degree, an enhanced insight into the mindset of the decision makers on the battlefields concerned. Such conclusions are useful to military historians and battlefield archaeologists to contribute to their research.

#### CYRIL OF JERUSALEM AND THE PROBLEM OF CATEGORIES

#### Jeremy Siemens University of St. Michael's College

Discussions concerning the fourth-century "Arian/Nicene" controversy tend to be very complex and nuanced. This complexity is a result of the problem of categorization, because most scholars over the centuries did not study the complexity of the controversy in great detail. As a result, many of the factions involved were lumped into the general category of "Arians," which did not present a clear and consistent picture of the opponents of Nicea.

Figures like Cyril of Jerusalem are good examples of the difficulty of defining and imposing such categories. Cyril, like several others, changed theological positions over time, and some of his disputes with his enemies involved politics and not just theology. He was made bishop of Jerusalem by "Arian" sympathizers, was later deposed by them and reinstated by "Nicenes," and eventually signed the creed at the council of Constantinople in 381 which supported the Nicene *homoousion* ("same-essence") definition of the Son of God's relationship to the Father. Depending on the timeline, Cyril possessed a variety of categories that some historians acknowledged and others did not. While church historian Theodoret and the synodical letter sent from the council of Constantinople both attempted to gloss over Cyril's embarrassing "Arian" associations, historians Socrates and Sozomen did not present as favorable a picture.

In contrast to what others said about him, what did Cyril understand about himself in the context of the wider church and his adversaries? What clues do the primary sources give to Cyril's position, and what do his own writings have to say about how he viewed himself and how he viewed doctrine? Is it possible to categorize Cyril, and if so, where can he be placed throughout his life?

Cyril's *Catechetical Lectures*, written approximately thirty years before the council of Constantinople, reveal that he saw himself as a defender of orthodox apostolic teaching, and he takes great pains to refute many heretical teachings. His lectures never directly refute any "Arian" or "Nicene" adversaries, but his theology on the Son of God is most closely associated with the *homoion* doctrine, that the Son is "like" the Father in all things (omitting any discussion of essence), in contrast to the "same-essence" *homoousion* definition of the councils of Nicea and Constantinople. His later associations with those at the council of Seleucia also linked him to the *homoiousion* ("similar-essence") definition, but these views are not within his writings.

Possible reasons for Cyril's delayed acceptance of the Nicene *homoousion* definition were due to his emphasis on the incomprehensibility of God, the limits of human wisdom and understanding in describing God, and his concern for teaching right doctrine. He was cautious of extreme teachings and warned of straying too far in one direction or another. Cyril seemed to be far more concerned with the worshipping life of the church and keeping it pure than with the controversies that were ripping it apart.

#### **SESSION IV**

Chair: Antony Littlewood emeritus, University of Western Ontario

### Text's Work - VIC 213

Pablo Argárate *University of St. Michael's College Kathodos eis Haiden:* Infernal Drama in Romanos Melodos's *Kontakia* 

Kevin Kalish
Princeton University

A Perspective from Below: The Lament of Hades in Romanos and the Byzantine Liturgical Tradition

Dorin Garofeanu *McMaster University*Springtime in Byzantium: *A.P.* 10.14-16

Anne-Laurence Caudano
University of Winnipeg
The Universe in an Eggshell:
Cosmographical Treatises in Late Byzantine Compilations

#### Kathodos eis Haiden: Infernal Drama In Romanos Melodos's Kontakia

#### Pablo Argárate University of St. Michael's College

Romanos is deemed one of the foremost hymnographers in the Byzantine tradition. Of Syrian origin, born in Emesa, and relocated afterwards to Beirut, it was in the capital of the Empire where, as a deacon, he brought the *kontakion* to its climax in the century of Justinian. It is proven that the *kontakia* manifest formal influence of Syriac poetry. The *memra*, the *madrasha*, and especially the *sogita* are thus to be regarded at the origins of the *kontakia*. Their sources are the *Diatessaron* and Ephrem's *madrashe*, from which they draw abundantly. In addition to this, we ought to refer to the deep dramatic and dialogical character of these compositions, the strength of their imagery along with the emphasis on the antithetical aspect with abundant usage of *oxymora*. All this made the *kontakion* a poetic form extremely appealing in its liturgical setting not only to the Byzantine world.

Romanos's extant *kontakia* number more than fifty and are distributed throughout the Church year, building one of the highpoints of Byzantine liturgy and evoking the mystery by means of diverse poetic structures and elements. Although the compositions on the Nativity are the most well known among the *oeuvre* of Romanos, the *kontakia* on the Resurrection (*anastasima*) are not less outstanding. In the corpus, we find six pieces referring to that event (Grosdidier de Matons 40-45). While 40-41 have a clear apologetic rationale, *kontakia* 42-45 evolve around Christ's descent into Hades. Furthermore, the personified Hades functions as the protagonist of those pieces. To these, we should even add hymn 38—On the Victory of the Cross—which shares the same thematic.

The topic of the descent into Hades is to be brought into relation with the ancient myth of Herakles's journey, representations of the liberation of Adam and Eve, and some apocryphal texts, mainly gospels. Already mentioned by Melitos of Sardis, it finds expression in some fathers of the church, chiefly in Ephrem. A special antecedent are the so-called "dramatical homilies" (chiefly from Basil of Seleucia, Proclus of Constantinople, Eusebius of Alexandria, Severian of Gabala, Amphilochius of Iconium, and Leontius of Constantinople). The aforementioned *kontakia* present several lively dialogues full of compelling imagery between Hades on the one side and Christ, Adam, Death, and the Serpent on the other. They build an outstanding dramatic tension enhanced by poetic resources, creating a superb approach to the mystery of the resurrection of Christ and the liberation of the dead from the power of Hades.

My paper undertakes a detailed analysis of this "infernal drama," in its varied themes, poetic components, and theological insights.

#### A Perspective from Below: The Lament of Hades in Romanos and the Byzantine Liturgical Tradition

#### Kevin Kalish Princeton University

While examples abound in the Byzantine liturgical tradition of figures such as the Mother of God uttering a lament, an utterance by Hades is rare. Yet at Matins (orthros) for the Holy Cross on the third Sunday of Lent, a personified Hades utters a lament to his companions in the underworld. This moment stands out for several reasons. First, Hades takes on a human voice and utters a lyrical monody—suggesting that Hades had some rhetorical and poetic training. In addition, this episode asks us to think about other traditions of giving a voice to Satan and Hades—a tradition that stretches back to dialogue poems in the Syriac tradition and to Greek rhetorical practices, but also stretches forward to Milton's imagining of Satan's voice in *Paradise Lost*. In this paper I argue that Hades's lament offers insight into the formation of liturgical poetry. This lament refashions these different Greek and Syriac traditions to produce a witty but also rhetorically effective device. Hades is brought before the listener to speak of his loss at the crucifixion; instead of the usual perspective of those on earth, the poet takes us to the underworld and lets us listen in on a subaltern perspective.

Hades's lament is transmitted in the Triodion, the service book for Great Lent, where it is the *oikos* found after the sixth ode of the canon (the customary place for the *kontakion* and the *oikos*) for the third Sunday of Lent. While the canon for the Holy Cross is attributed to St. Theodore the Studite, the *kontakion* and *oikos* are from a longer *kontakion* by St. Romanos the Melodist (number 22 in the edition of Mass and Trypanis). Previous scholarship has tended to focus on the Syriac influence—especially the Syriac "dispute poems"—on Romanos and Greek liturgical poetry in general. However, this imagining of what Hades might say also points to the Greek rhetorical practice of *ethopoiia*, an exercise in which students were asked to imagine what a historic figure might have said. Christian examples of *ethopoiia* exist from as early as the fourth century and numerous examples abound in Byzantium; Hades's lament should also be considered part of this tradition.

Rather than establish a lineage of influence, I instead examine how Romanos took an inherited tradition and refigured and reworked it. For a culture that esteemed tradition over innovation, Hades's lament shows how imitation can be creative. Byzantine poetry in general has often been dismissed as unoriginal and uninspired; while many problems exist in this assumption, one difficulty is its failure to recognize the creativity at work in reimagining the past. In creating a character "Hades" and giving him a voice, Romanos employs rhetorical devices to bring to life and invest with speech, something that otherwise would be a mere abstract concept. Furthermore, a comparison with the other great poem to personify the rulers of the underworld, Milton's *Paradise Lost*, offers insight into the broader literary phenomenon of envisioning the cast of the underworld and giving them a voice.

#### Springtime in Byzantium: A.P. 10.14-16

# Dorin Garofeanu *McMaster University*

The *Palatine Anthology* includes nine spring poems: *A.P.* 9.363; 10.1, 2, 4-6, 14-16. Although each of these epigrams can be read on its own, the similarities between them suggest deliberate encouragement of readers to compare and contrast them.

Starting from the premise that these texts were deeply influenced by the "pressure" of the genre, the paper provides a schema that can be applied to all these poems. Containing a description of spring and the reactions prompted by the season, each particular epigram uses the traditional elements of the genre in a different way, emphasizing one or another, omitting, inverting or playing them down.

A comparative analysis of the spring poems written by the Byzantine authors Agathias Scholasticus (*A.P.* 10. 14), Paulus Silentiarius (*A.P.* 10. 15) and Theaetetus Scholasticus (*A.P.* 10. 16) reveals how the use of the Hellenistic techniques of *imitatio cum variatione* and *aemulatio* has led to diversity within the genre but also to a certain continuity in the basic elements.

Agathias Scholasticus succeeds, without mentioning the traditional cables, the anchors, the sails or any other maritime paraphernalia, to center *A.P.* 10.14 on sea and seafaring, and, thus, considering that the opening of the navigation season was, in fact, the main theme of the spring poems included in the *Palatine Anthology*, to compose an epigram that, while having its own identity and pointed focus, preserves the characteristic features of a spring poem and the vernal spirit of the genre.

Whether Paulus Silentiarius is intentionally writing a subversive epigram and *A.P.* 10.15 could thus be considered a subtle mockery of the genre, or it is just the case that the tone of this poem was influenced by the Byzantine milieu in which its author lived, *A.P.* 10.15 is characterized by a remarkable stylistic playfulness and self-irony.

Theaetetus Scholasticus's spring poem is distinctive through its new and puzzling elements (e.g. the blooming roses, the cicada, the cypress, the binder of sheaves), striking imagery (e.g., the "pregnant" field and the "beastly" sea), sophistication and humor.

This survey of the Byzantine spring poems reveals an intricate evolution in which the theme of spring is subtly modified only to be continuously repeated. *A.P.* 10.14, 15 and 16 are not only refined pieces of writing but also highly innovative poems, a rather remarkable accomplishment at such a late stage in the tradition of the genre, concluding, climactically, the series of spring poems included in the *Palatine Anthology*.

# THE Universe in an Eggshell: Cosmographical Treatises in Late Byzantine Compilations

## Anne-Laurence Caudano *University of Winnipeg*

Extensive astronomical treatises and biblical commentaries, for instance on the Book of Genesis, are the usual places to find elaborate descriptions of heaven and earth in Byzantine literature. However, shorter treatises with cosmographical, geographical and meteorological information are also included in florilegia of an astrological, theological or biblical nature. These cosmographical texts go back to a common prototype, which, according to S.N. Gukova, was written originally by the Byzantine theologian and philosopher Eustratios of Nicea at the turn of the twelfth century. Eustratios's authorship remains uncertain, though. Moreover, the text itself has been adapted and appears in longer or shorter versions. More study should be done, therefore, to identify and situate this cosmographical tradition in the Byzantine scholarship of the time.

The text is divided in several sections related to fundamental cosmographical issues such as the four elements and their place in the world, the structure and dimension of heaven and earth, the formation of clouds, the antipodes, Paradise, and the causes of earthquakes, among others. The treatises blend classical sciences and scriptural interpretations. This is nothing exceptional; many other cosmographical texts deal with comparable subjects in this way. What makes them more original, however, is their departure from a pure spherical cosmos. In these treatises, the shape of the universe is that of a barrel or an egg, where the yolk stands for the earth, the membrane around the yolk for the air, and the white and the shell for the succession of heavenly spheres. Ultimately, this notion goes back to early Greek cosmologists such as Empedocles.

So far, sixteen Byzantine manuscripts have been identified. Most of them date from the fifteenth century and reproduce the treatise in full or in part. Very close adaptations of these Byzantine treatises have also been found in Slavic compilations from the fifteenth to the seventeenth centuries: collections of sermons, Old Testament histories (Palei), as well as astrological works. Their textual tradition in Slavic literature generally has been better studied than in the Byzantine world. In fact, little has been done on their Byzantine equivalent. By focusing on the Byzantine tradition of these texts, this paper sheds light on their place within Byzantine cosmographical literature, their role in these eclectic collections, and their relationship with their Slavic counterparts.

#### **SESSION V**

Chair: Anthony Kaldellis Ohio State University

## Transitions from the Ancient World - VIC 213

Elizabeth A. Fisher George Washington University The Byzantine Translator's Preface

Nicholas Everett *University of Toronto*The Alphabet of Galen and Pharmacology in the Dark Ages

Conor Whately *University of Warwick*History and Poetry in the Descriptions of Battle in Agathias's *Histories* 

Craig A. Gibson *University of Iowa*The Daphne Myth in Greek Progymnasmata

#### THE BYZANTINE TRANSLATOR'S PREFACE

# Elizabeth A. Fisher George Washington University

Although translation into Greek of foreign literary works is a rare phenomenon, rarer yet are the Greek translators who turned their attention and talents to Latin literary works. The pioneer among them was Manuel Holobolos, who translated into Greek not only two rhetorical works by the late Roman philosopher Boethius but also the pseudo-Aristotelian work *De plantis*. Each translation is introduced by a formal preface in which Holobolos attempts to direct and condition the reaction of his intended audience to the foreign work they will encounter via his translation. In his prefaces, Holobolos justifies the value of the original Latin work, establishes his own credentials for choosing it as worthy of attention, remarks upon the superiority of Greek literature to all other literatures, and offers colorful vignettes focused upon the author of the original work or upon his own experiences as translator. Holobolos's prefaces are designed to engage his audience and to dispose them favorably to a work naturalized into Greek through the process of translation.

In content and ostensible purpose, these translator's prefaces resemble the self-revealing authors' prefaces encountered in Greek literary works of both the Byzantine and classical periods. Among Byzantine authors, Leo the Deacon provides a useful parallel and perhaps precedent for Holobolos's prefaces as does Thucydides among classical authors. In their prefaces, authors and translator alike create authorial personae for their intended audiences and reveal their assumptions about the nature of those audiences.

The middle Byzantine period offers translations of the Arabic *Oneirokritikon* or *Book of Dreams* that provide a particularly rich source of prefatory material for analysis and comparison with Holobolos's prefaces, since four distinct translators' prefaces survive with the Greek version of the *Oneirokritikon*. Moreover, two Sicilian translators employed in Constantinople at the court of Manuel I, Leo Tuscus and Pascalis Romanus, rendered excerpts from the *Oneirokritikon* into Latin and appended a translator's preface to their versions. These several examples of the middle Byzantine translator's preface provide evidence enabling us to determine whether Holobolos conformed to an existing genre of translator's preface or introduced an innovative literary feature to accompany his translations from Latin.

# THE ALPHABET OF GALEN AND PHARMACOLOGY IN THE DARK AGES

#### Nicholas Everett University of Toronto

The Alphabetum Galieni is a pseudo-Galenic work that describes in alphabetical order nearly 300 different types of substances, mostly herbs, used for medicinal purposes. Compiled sometime from the third to the fifth century CE, it was included among the major collections of early Latin translations of ancient Greek medical works in the West, and was therefore a chief source of pharmacological knowledge in early medieval Europe until the twelfth century, when its information was pillaged for larger, more ambitious pharmacopoeia. Initially considered to be derivative of similar works such as Dioscorides's De materia medica, Pliny's Naturalis historia, or Pseudo-Apuleius's Herbarium, the Alphabetum Galieni is in fact independent of these works and transmits information from ancient Greek sources now lost to us. This paper will briefly outline the content and scope of the Alphabetum Galieni, consider its possible sources and style of technical Latin, and suggest that, contrary to its attribution to Galen, the Alphabetum in fact represents an earlier, pragmatic tradition of ancient pharmacology which was much more useful, and hence more popular, in the early medieval West than Galen's abstract, theoretical approach to drugs, which remained dominant in the Byzantine East.

# HISTORY AND POETRY IN THE DESCRIPTIONS OF BATTLE IN AGATHIAS'S Histories

# Conor Whately *University of Warwick*

In Lucian's How to Write History he says that if those authors who fail to recognize the differences between history and poetry are allowed free rein, "[history] becomes but a sort of prosepoetry, lacking indeed the high style of poetry, but showing the rest of poetry's sorcery without metre" (Lucian, Hist. conscr. 8). Lucian is worried that if poetic embellishment is introduced persons and events will be unnecessarily exaggerated and history will move ever closer to panegyric. Would, then, Lucian have been shocked if he had read the Histories of Agathias? For Agathias was not an ordinary Byzantine historian; he was not an historian who used a touch of poetry in his work, but a poet who turned to history, allegedly at the suggestion of friends. Indeed Agathias devotes several chapters of the preface of his *Histories* to his not inconsiderable dabbling in poetry. The products of this considerable interest were "written with no strictly practical end in view, but [were] otherwise potentially amusing and entertaining" (Agathias Hist. 8). What are we to make of this situation, or, what would Lucian? As it turns out, Lucian is not totally averse to the utilization of poetic language to improve the vividness of an historical narrative, particularly when it comes to the narration of a battle (Lucian, Hist. conscr. 45, 49). How much then does poetry shape Agathias's battle narratives? Scholars such as Averil Cameron (1970, Agathias, London) and Anthony Kaldellis (1997, "Agathias on History and Poetry," GRBS 38: 295-305) have discussed both Lucian and Agathias in regard to the relationship between history and poetry in Agathias's preface, and to a certain degree, the narrative as a whole. The poetic qualities of Agathias's descriptions of battle, however, have largely escaped the notice of those same scholars, much as it has those concerned with military history. Thus, in this paper I shall discuss the influence that poetry has on Agathias's battle narratives, with especial attention paid to his descriptions of the Siege of Cumae (553 CE), the Battle of Casilinum (554 CE), the Siege of Onoguris (554 CE), the Battle of Phasis (555 CE), and the Battle of Chettus (559 CE). Like his predecessor Procopius's descriptions of battle in the Wars, particularly the Gothic Wars, Agathias's descriptions of battle in the Histories are suffused with poetry. What is more, the poetic quality of the battle scenes enlivens his narratives as much as we would expect given his own statements about his poetry. This does not detract from Agathias's underlying historical aim/s (i.e., the moral didactic focus of the work), and in fact actually enriches it/them. Finally, the poetry does not obfuscate his accounts of those battles, as Cameron and Rance suggest (2004, "The Fulcum, the Late Roman and Byzantine Testudo. The Germanisation of Roman Infantry Tactics," GRBS 44: 265-326).

#### THE DAPHNE MYTH IN GREEK Progymnasmata

Craig A. Gibson *University of Iowa* 

From Aphthonius to John Kinnamos, the myth of Daphne appears frequently in Greek *progymnasmata* in four exercises: narration, refutation and confirmation, and *ethopoeia*. After learning to retell the story in brief (narration), students learned to compose detailed refutations and confirmations of the myth, particularly after Aphthonius's paired examples became part of the Byzantine student's standard textbook experience. In his sample pair it is debated how Earth and a river god could conceive a child, how she could attract Apollo, and then how she could successfully outrun him to her unconditionally supportive mother and yet be honored by Apollo. These are quite ordinary exercises; there is little to distinguish them from other surviving examples of refutation and confirmation. One exception to this generalization is an exercise of unknown date, in which the myth is confirmed from the perspective of "Christian allegoresis" (so the title): the story, it is suggested, is a celebration of chastity and the foresight that comes from self-control.

Far more innovative uses of the Daphne myth are found in two groups of *ethopoeiae*; Apollo is the speaker in one group, and a painter in the other. These *ethopoeiae* differ in emphasis from the refutation and confirmation exercises dealing with Daphne, in that they largely leave behind the former's concern with the circumstances of Daphne's birth, the question of her virtue, and her human flight from Apollo. We have, instead, Dioscorus's brief treatment of Apollo's speech when Hyacinthus and Daphne are changed into plants at the same time; an incomplete poem by George Grammatikos cast as an *ethopoeia* in which Apollo has just stumbled on a rose thorn while pursuing Daphne; and another by the same author in which Apollo catches Eros garlanding his bow and arrows with the laurel (*daphnê*) and rose. There are also three examples in which a painter is the speaker. Severus of Alexandria presents a theme in which a painter who has successfully treated themes of lovers in the past (including Apollo and Daphne) has now fallen in love with a picture of a girl he painted. In a treatment by Libanius which influenced a much later one by John Kinnamos, we have the lament of a previously successful painter whose laurel-wood canvas (*daphnê*) will not absorb the paint from a depiction of Apollo; the girl holds an eternal grudge against the god, even in her transformed state.

In this paper I argue that these *ethopoeiae* featuring the Daphne theme provided their authors with a creative space in which to combine and explore two different themes that are prominent in the *progymnasmata*: the suffering caused by (especially unrequited) *erôs*, and the slippery relationship between art (*technê*) and the nature (*physis*) it seeks to imitate or even supplant. These two themes connect the *ethopoeiae* on Daphne both with other *ethopoeiae* in which the speaker suffers because of *erôs* (e.g. a sculptor, a eunuch, a prostitute) and with the *ecphrases* of statues by Pseudo-Nicolaus, in which he frequently alludes to the relationship between art and nature.

## **SESSION VI**

Chair: Cecily Hilsdale Northwestern University

## Death and Memory - VIC 112

Wendy Mayer
Australian Catholic University
The Late Antique Church at Kaoussie Reconsidered

Ann Marie Yasin *University of Southern California*Peering at Sanctity: Sight Lines and the Sacred at Late Antique Martyria

Robert Ousterhout
University of Pennsylvania
Nilay Karakaya
Erciyes University, Kayseri
Life and Death in Byzantine Cappadocia

#### THE LATE ANTIQUE CHURCH AT KAOUSSIE RECONSIDERED

# Wendy Mayer Australian Catholic University

The cruciform church at Kaoussie, excavated in 1935 by the Princeton-led expedition to Syrian Antioch, was at the time identified by Glanville Downey as the Church of St. Babylas. This identification, which relies on its situation (across the Orontes), a dated inscription (387 CE) and the discovery of a double sarcophagus set into the floor of the central chamber, has been persuasive to the present day. Cumulatively the evidence led Downey to argue that construction on the church was begun in 379-380. The church, however, contains an additional eighteen sub-pavement burials, many of them set beneath the mosaic paving of the four arms after the pavement was laid. It has been assumed that these represent later additions to the church, inserted into the floor progressively over the history of the church (up to the late sixth century).

The title to a homily delivered by John Chrysostom during his presbyterate at Antioch (386-397), however, refers to a martyrium at Romanesia. The burials within this martyrium, John explains in the prooimion, have recently been rearranged by the city's bishop, Flavian (381-404), for the benefit of the souls who come there to pray. Where previously the tombs of all the martyrs, regardless of their theological stance, were accessible to those who came to ask for their assistance in prayer, Flavian has reconfigured the burials in such a way that, without disturbing the location in which they are buried, the tombs of non-Nicene martyrs have been set below the floor. Are the church at Kaoussie and the Romanesian martyrium one and the same?

In this paper the evidence for identifying the church as both the Church of Babylas and the Romanesian martyrium is presented and the possibility that construction on the church began in the 360s is discussed.

# Peering at Sanctity: Sight Lines and the Sacred at Late Antique Martyria

#### Ann Marie Yasin University of Southern California

It is well known that over the course of the Late Antique centuries altars and saints' relics became increasingly assimilated into a single, sacred focal point. At the same time, altar sites are not the only places where the remains of saints were housed. Indeed, many of the most famous Late Antique martyria preserve relics and monumentalize saints' cults within spaces architecturally distinct from the liturgical area around the altar. Since as least as far back as the publication of Grabar's *Martyrium* (1946), it has been conventional to read such spatially segregated sites as indicative of a fundamental separation between the celebration of the eucharistic liturgy and the veneration of sacred relics.

This paper suggests that the spatial partitioning between the two types of cultic centers was in some cases less sharp in the experience of the contemporary visitors than it appears to us from architectural plans. Architectural programs could be arranged so as to provide visitors with a visual link between liturgical space and martyrium despite the physical separation between the two types of sacred focal points. On the one hand several sites offer suggestive archaeological indications for windows or light wells which could afford viewers inside the basilica building glimpses of an architecturally distanced martyrium. In addition, the writings of Paulinus of Nola and Evagrius's Ecclesiastical History articulate something of the aims and effects of employing such visual and architectural strategies. At the complex built up by Paulinus around the shrine of St. Felix at Cimitile in the early fifth century and that housing St. Euphemia's memorial at Chalcedon described by Evagrius, the saint's tomb lay within a structure situated outside the main basilican hall. Yet, both Paulinus and Evagrius expressly emphasized the way in which the architectural arrangement afforded the visitor visual access between the two cultic focal points. Evagrius praised the spatial configuration between Euphemia's martyrium and basilica for allowing visitors simultaneously to witness the Eucharistic celebration and to venerate the martyr's remains (Hist. Ecc. II.3). For his part, in boasting about his construction of the lavish Basilica Nova and his architectural interventions immediately surrounding Felix's tomb itself, Paulinus repeatedly stressed the new visual connection he was able to achieve between the two, thereby linking old and new constructions and creating a more unified complex as a whole (Ep. 32). Such testimony indicates that at least at some Late Antique martyria where altar and relics were spatially disconnected, it was deemed important to orchestrate sight lines that allowed visitors to bridge with their eyes the physical distance separating distinct sacred focal points.

#### LIFE AND DEATH IN BYZANTINE CAPPADOCIA

Robert Ousterhout University of Pennsylvania Nilay Karakaya Erciyes University, Kayseri

The Soğanlı Dere ("Onion Valley") lies in the south of the volcanic region of Cappadocia, in the province of Kayseri, about 15 km west of the town of Yeşilhisar, and about 80 km southwest of the city of Kayseri. Rather than a monastic settlement, it seems to have been a thriving agrarian settlement in the Byzantine period named Soandos, located by the road between Malakopea (Derinkuyu) and Kyzistra (Yeşilhisar). In the middle Byzantine period, it was associated with the Skepides family, land barons whose names appear in the dedicatory inscriptions of two of its churches. As is the case throughout Cappadocia, almost all of the architecture from the Byzantine period is rock-cut, including simple houses, as well as mansions, agricultural establishments, churches, chapels, monasteries, tombs, and cemeteries.

The Byzantine monuments of the valley were first systematically studied in1907-11 by G. de Jerphanion, who concentrated on the painted churches. Additional monuments have been published by Thierry, Gürçay and Akok, Rodley, and Blanchard and Couprie. These studies have examined individual buildings (and occasionally complexes of buildings, incompletely recorded) and their decoration in isolation, without attempting to situate them within the larger context of the settlement as a whole, and without attempting to unravel complex issues of chronology and function. Moreover, the utilitarian and funerary architecture (including extensive cemeteries) has been almost entirely overlooked.

We believe the Soğanlı Valley offers a unique perspective on both life and death in Byzantine Cappadocia, preserving important evidence for the organization of an agrarian community primarily of the late ninth through the eleventh centuries, with architectural forms representing all levels and components of its Byzantine society. Moreover, a close analysis of the physical relationships and internal chronology of its major foundations offers a new understanding of the significance of the commemoration of the dead and the position of monasticism within a Byzantine provincial community.

The paper will present the results of the first season of a joint project of the University of Pennsylvania and Erciyes University to map the settlement and to document its architecture and painting (July 2007).

#### **SESSION VII**

Chair: Brian Boeck DePaul University

## Byzantino-Serbian Culture - VIC 112

Rossitza B. Schroeder *University of Virginia*Theophanic Imagery in the Narthex of the Virgin Peribleptos in Ohrid

Ida Sinkević *Lafayette College*The Royal Door at Marko's Monastery

Robert Romanchuk Florida State University

The Organization and Practice of Knowledge in Byzantino-Serbian Elite Women's Education

Vessela Anguelova *The Pennsylvania State University Zoodochos Pege*, St. Michael in Lesnovo and the Serbian Aristocracy

> Boris A. Todorov Yonsei University

Discourses of Power and Universal Chronicles: Byzantine Chronicles Among the South Slavs in the Fourteenth Century

#### THEOPHANIC IMAGERY IN THE NARTHEX OF THE VIRGIN PERIBLEPTOS IN OHRID

Rossitza B. Schroeder University of Virginia

Frequently mentioned, but never exhaustively studied, the program of the narthex of the Virgin Peribleptos church in Ohrid epitomizes the artistic trends and spiritual concerns of the early Palaiologan era. Since the rediscovery and cleaning of the church's exquisite frescoes in the twentieth century, a serious intellectual debate has revolved around the style of its images. Some scholars argue that this is the earliest monument painted in the new, so-called "heavy" style, characteristic of early fourteenth-century Byzantine art; while others maintain that the painters of the Peribleptos were influenced by an enigmatic Greek artist, Manuel Panselinos, who first worked in the Protaton church on Mount Athos.

While art historians have been enmeshed in problems of chronology and precedents, issues of iconography and pictorial choices have received little attention. This paper is the first attempt to tie together the frescoed Old Testament visions in the Peribleptos narthex in a coherent and meaningful way and to reveal a number of associative possibilities. I elaborate on the Marian dimension of these theophanic images and stress how they functioned as visual stimuli for monastic contemplation. Several pictorial motifs are given prominence here: the material manifestations of God through visions and dreams, and the importance of sanctuary construction. In monastic edifying literature, building activities are metaphors for salvation, and striving for spiritual perfection is commonly referred to in architectural terms as the building of a temple. I argue that the images of the Old Testament visionaries in the narthex of the Peribleptos church functioned as spiritual models for the monks. Just as a glimpse of the Divine was granted to Moses, Jacob and Daniel because of their worth, so the monks, while laboring to imitate them, hoped for a similar favor.

#### THE ROYAL DOOR AT MARKO'S MONASTERY

#### Ida Sinkević Lafayette College

The presence of royal doors in western medieval cathedrals and churches has been a widely discussed topic. Much less attention has been given to the iconography, function, and location of entrances that were reserved for royalty in Byzantine churches. This paper examines the location and decoration of the south entrance of the fourteenth-century church of St. Demetrios, near Susica in the Republic of Macedonia, popularly known as Marko's monastery, and assesses that it was intended for the entrance of the king.

Marko's monastery is a royal foundation. It was begun in 1346/47 under the auspices of Serbian king Vukasin and completed in 1376/77, during the reign and under the patronage of Vukasin's son, King Marko. Although the typikon of the monastery is lost, the function of the south door can be determined through a careful analysis of the inscription and iconographic program that surrounds this entrance on both the exterior and the interior of the edifice.

The images in the lunette above the door on the exterior of the church include unusual representations of kings Vukasin and Marko and have been discussed by scholars. While emphasizing royal presence, the portraits of kings were commonly displayed by the entrances in medieval Serbian churches and as such do not necessarily reveal the function of the door. That the south door was indeed intended for the entrance of the kings is, however, indicated by the spatial articulation of the program of the church's interior. Singled out for its unique iconography, the painted decoration of Marko's monastery displays the Royal Deesis, a scene seldom represented in Byzantine churches. The scene faces the entrance and the image of the king which, as this paper maintains, is conceptually included in the procession of saints on the opposite wall. The function of the south door is also made apparent in the content of the inscription that is placed above the door and saturated with royal overtones.

While focused on an analysis of both interior and exterior decoration of the south portal in order to determine its function, the paper also raises the question of the need for a more systematic and a broader study of the appearance, physical location, and the meaning of decorative programs of royal entrances in Byzantium in general.

# THE ORGANIZATION AND PRACTICE OF KNOWLEDGE IN BYZANTINO-SERBIAN ELITE WOMEN'S EDUCATION

### Robert Romanchuk Florida State University

The Serb-Montenegrin *Gorica Miscellany* of 1441/42 (Belgrade SANU 446), which preserves the correspondence of the royal nun Jelena Balsic with her spiritual director Nikon of Jerusalem alongside the hesychastic and secondary-school textbooks that they discussed, challenges claims that the path of learning was barred to Byzantine women—as well as the traditional scholarly opposition between "hesychasts" and "monks dabbling in humanism." Nikon's juxtaposition of writings such as the *Scete Rule* linked to Gregory of Sinai and textbooks attributed to Byzantine "humanists" such as Eustratius of Nicaea indicates that Jelena was expected to contemplate the objects of history and cosmology at her retreat on Lake Skadar. Similarly, Nikon's regular appeal in his letters to *physical* terms (as analogies, types, etc.), alongside critiques of "worldly wisdom," suggests that the study of nature was, for the veiled princess, a *spiritual exercise*: a technique to transform her soul and lead it to a stage of greater perfection (cf. the studies of Pierre Hadot).

In his second epistle to Jelena (ff. 36-36v), Nikon lays out a curriculum of study following the Neoplatonic progression from ethics to physics and epoptics; it appears to share elements of both the "desert" and "academic" Christian adaptations of this curriculum, promoted by John Climacus (in the *Ladder*) and John Damascene (in the *Fount of Knowledge*), respectively. However, if the "material-textual" organization of knowledge in the *Miscellany* follows the Neoplatonic ordering, with ethical teachings at the beginning and physical teachings toward the end, Nikon apparently advises Jelena to engage in the practice of all three areas at once, in an echo of Stoic pedagogy. Moreover, the material foregrounding of the correspondence of student and teacher (the textbooks forming a kind of appendix to Nikon's third epistle) suggests that the dialogic give-and-take of teaching and learning is superior to the very material studied—as was the case in philosophy as "lived" in antiquity (Hadot). Indeed, *correspondence* is the characteristic genre of this pedagogy (cf. the analogous correspondence of the Greek royal nun Irene-Eulogia Choumnaina with her director: in this instance, the textbooks exchanged, although recalled in the letters, have not even been preserved). In this way, the conventual education of elite women recovered key structures and practices of antique philosophical pedagogy.

# Zoodochos Pege, St. Michael in Lesnovo and the Serbian Aristocracy

#### Vessela Anguelova The Pennsylvania State University

In 1347 the Council of Skopje promoted the Serbian church to a Patriarchal seat, independent of the Constantinopolitan Patriarchate. The Council enacted the ambitions of the Serbian ruler and nobility to elevate the status of their state implementing Byzantine models of rulership. Stefan Dušan assumed the title king. Removing the subordinate position of the Serbian church, he assured his greater control over its affairs. King Dušan also gave matching responsibilities to his courtiers. John Oliver, for example, had to approve the selection of a bishop for his titular church St. Michael in Lesnovo. This need arose after the church was made the seat of the newly created bishopric of Zletovo at the Council of Skopje.

Responding to the importance of St. Michael in the church hierarchy, John Oliver enlarged it with a narthex and paid for its decoration in 1349. The iconographic program shows Old Testament scenes, representations of the last psalms, and the symbolic representation of Christ *Anapeson*. Illustrations called "the teachings of the church fathers," and an image of the Virgin *Zoodochos Pege*, the life-giving spring, are also included. The latter shows the Virgin dipped in a cup. This image was associated with a famous healing spring at a monastery in Constantinople. Its inclusion in the narthex is crucial for understanding the overall message of the iconographic program.

I propose that the wall paintings work together to legitimize the newly established Serbian Patriarchal Church through a theological argument. This theological argument is about the presence and the appearances of God to men. In the context of Old Testament theophanies, such as those to Jacob when he dreamed of the ladder and of his struggle with an angel, to Moses receiving the Law, and to Ezekiel seeing the temple of God, the *Zoodochos Pege* links the past to the present. It suggests that divine interventions and agency are not limited to scriptures but are accessible to all in miracles. Other images in the narthex also emphasize the accessibility of God. I propose that representations evoke the ultimate epiphany of God in Christ, signified by the Resurrection. In my view, the images of the last psalms, Christ *Anapeson*, and the inscriptions in church fathers' portraits were chosen to evoke the Easter liturgy. The traditional message expressed with theophanies becomes charged when considered in the context of the illustrations of the last psalms. These give examples of militant defenders of the Christian faith. The emphasis on the protection of faith may be compared to the resolute decision of the Serbians to practice Christianity independently from Constantinople. The Zoodochos Pege is significant in such a program since the monastery of the spring was a place of an imperial presence. Thus the Serbian aristocracy emulated Byzantine models of rulership also by adopting an image of a miracle-location with imperial associations.

#### Discourses of Power and Universal Chronicles: Byzantine Chronicles Among the South Slavs in the Fourteenth Century

### Boris A. Todorov Yonsei University

The paper addresses the question why, during the fourteenth century, four major Byzantine universal chronicles were made available to the South Slavs: those by George the Monk (*Hamartolos*, midninth century, supplemented with material from the *Logothete* until the year 948), Symeon the Logothete (the *Logothete*, 960s), John Zonaras (*Zonaras*, mid-eleventh century), and Constantine Manasses (*Manasses*, 1180s). The oldest translated universal chronicle, by John Malalas, and the earlier, East Slavic, translation of *Hamartolos* are not discussed because they were not circulating among the South Slavs during the period. Until now, there is no explanation for the need to provide translations of all four chronicles whose content is largely overlapping. This is particularly the case for the *Logothete* and *Hamartolos* which cover the same material, while the selective Church Slavic translation of the more expanded *Zonaras* skipped most of pagan Roman history and, thus, ended in a format similar to the other two.

The paper draws on the published Slavic translations of *Manasses* (ed. Bogdan), the *Logothete* (ed. Sreznevskii), and *Zonaras* (ed. Jakobs; edition is partial), and on three manuscripts from the collection of the Chilandari Monastery available on microfilm at the Chilandari Research Library, at the Ohio State University: Chilandari 381, 433 and 434 (fourteenth through sixteenth centuries). In order to explain the purpose of the multiple translations of Byzantine historical works, it attempts to identify the intended audience for each of the four chronicles based on various indicators pointing to their reception and transmission. Such indicators are the selection and omission of material, the visible state of the manuscripts, the problems the translators faced in coping with the Greek texts, their choice of terminology reflecting the social and political realities of the Roman and Byzantine worlds, precise or misplaced renditions of toponyms, etc.

Through the analysis of representative cases, the paper suggests that the various translations of historical works point to the concerns of lay and ecclesiastical power-holders of the fourteenth century (particularly the latter half) regarding recent or ongoing events. The position which the anonymous translators took on smaller and bigger issues reflect debates over the political and ecclesiastical hierarchies of the period: the Serbian imperial policy of the mid-century, the schism between the Serbian and the Byzantine churches, the controversies regarding the hierarchical superiority of Constantinople over Turnovo, or the legitimacy of Serbian and Bulgarian claims over former Byzantine territories. At the same time, these translations reveal the dependence of lay authorities on the intellectual production of the large monastic communities, especially those on Mount Athos. The paper suggests that the parallel translations of various Byzantine historiographical works reflect the stakes which different sources of authority saw in the correct and exhaustive representation of the important events in history. More generally, it shows how translated works allow new approaches to the study of political thought in the late medieval Balkans.

#### **SESSION VIII**

Chair: Adam Schor Long Island University

### Theology and Council - VIC 213

Patrick T. R. Gray
emeritus, York University
What Was the "Union" of 433 Really About? A Crucial Topos of Sixth-Century Debate

Dana-Iuliana Viezure
University of Toronto
Theopaschism in the Aftermath of Chalcedon:
An Early Prefiguration of Neo-Chalcedonianism

Jesse W. Torgerson *University of California, Berkeley*The Patriarch Kallistos I's *Life of St. Gregory of Sinai* as a Source for the Origins of Palaeologan Hesychast Practice

James C. Skedros

Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology

Orthodoxy, Heresy, and Sanctity in Pre-Iconoclastic Byzantine Hagiography

Jeffrey Wickes *University of Notre Dame*The Ambiguous Role of the Byzantine Empire in
Pseudo-Ephrem's *Homily on the End* 

# What was the "Union" of 433 really about? A Crucial Topos of Sixth-Century Debate

### Patrick T. R. Gray emeritus, York University

The "Union" of 433 between Cyril of Alexandria and John of Antioch is often considered a statesmanlike meeting of minds along the way to the "settlement" of christology by Chalcedon. What the subscription of both sides to it meant was, rather, fiercely debated from that moment on, not least in the first half of the sixth century. It was by then central to the fundamental issue about Chalcedon, its loyalty, or lack of it, to the fathers. The pro-Chalcedonian case always appealed to the "Union," since it affirmed the legitimacy of talk about two natures, in Chalcedonian eyes making Chalcedon cyrillian when it said Christ was "in two natures"—the very point on which anti-Chalcedonians rejected Chalcedon as *un*-cyrillian, pointing to Cyril's assertion of "one incarnate nature." For them, the "Union" needed in some sense to be explained away.

Severus of Antioch spoke to this issue over a period of years. In the *Philalethes* he sets Cyril's subscription to the "Union" in the context of years of cynical Antiochene plotting: It was a trap set for Cyril, an attempt to implicate him in Antiochene christological language. However, Cyril masterfully outmaneuvered them, defanging the "two natures" language of the statement, first by committing the Antiochenes to abandoning Nestorius and to accepting cyrillian language, and second by adopting their infantile christological language only to educate them towards more mature formulations. John "the Grammarian" seized upon Cyril's defensive claim that the Antiochenes with whom he had agreed in 433 had acknowledged the necessary truths, but had been "in the dark" about terminology, to maintain that what they all agreed about as truth was "two natures," but the Antiochenes had been uncertain about Cyril's "one incarnate nature." Severus asserted the opposite: what the Antiochenes were in the dark about was actually the proper way to talk about natures, but "one incarnate nature" had been a non-negotiable truth.

The debate continued at the Conversations of 532, though there anti-Chalcedonians described Cyril in 433 rather as a "doctor" dealing with an emergency, a man who temporarily indulged his sick opponents in the hope of healing them. Shortly after that Leontius of Jerusalem gave the argument a new twist: he attempted to turn Severus's followers against him by caricaturing him as a megalomaniac who thought he was better than Cyril, someone claiming to "cure" Cyril's self-contradictory behavior in 433 (accepting "one incarnate nature" and "two natures") by downgrading "two natures" and reducing everything to "one incarnate nature." Leontius's claim was that he himself humbly accepted simply what a non-contradictory Cyril plainly intended: that "one incarnate nature" meant exactly what Chalcedon's "two natures united in one hypostasis" meant.

The claim to represent the historical Cyril thus involved complex and continuously evolving rhetorical constructions of a historical event both sides appealed to for legitimation.

### Theopaschism in the Aftermath of Chalcedon: An Early Prefiguration of Neo-Chalcedonianism

#### Dana-Iuliana Viezure University of Toronto

The history of Theopaschism in the first three decades after Chalcedon can be revealed mainly from the writings of the anti-Chalcedonian Timothy Aelurus, who occupied the front stage of theology and ecclesiastical politics between 457 and 477, leaving an indelible imprint on the mindset of subsequent generations of anti- and non-Chalcedonians.

With the fragile balance established in 433 officially broken by a more radical "peace," that of 451, many restrictions by which the controversies of the first half of the fifth century had abided disappeared suddenly. It was in this context that Theopaschism emerged as the *modus narrandi* par excellence of the anti-Chalcedonian discourse on the Incarnation.

Though well aware of Theopaschism's tormented past, Timothy Aelurus gave it a new life by presenting it as the most natural mode of discourse on the Incarnation, by not making any references to its controversial past, and by taking up a non-defensive attitude when using it. Although little is preserved from the writings of Timothy's predecessor, Dioscorus, certain passages quoted by Timothy allow us to infer that Dioscorus had used a very similar approach. This rhetorical strategy gave Theopaschism a real chance to prevail over the Dyophysites' resistance to it.

Timothy's favorite Theopaschite phrase was "God suffered in the flesh," the same that would incite and trouble theologians and statesmen six decades later. It appears time and again in his refutation of Leo's Tome, and quite frequently in the rest of his writings against the Dyophysites.

There is evidence from the Chalcedonian side—in particular Vigilius of Thapsus's *Contra Eutychen*—showing that Timothy's strategy was, if not truly successful, at least somewhat efficient. It made Dyophysite Christology more permeable to Theopaschism, to the point where Vigilius endowed a phrase such as *Deus passus* with formulaic character, and proclaimed it a standard of orthodoxy.

Together with other elements that make an appearance in texts from this period (the idea that there is no real difference in content between the formulas "in two natures," "from two natures," and "one incarnate nature," that the formula of Chalcedon was intended as a mere disciplinary instrument, that Pope Leo's Tome was inherently consistent with the Christology of Cyril of Alexandria), this emergence of Theopaschism helps us reconstruct the prehistory of the Neo-Chalcedonian stance on Christology.

# The Patriarch Kallistos I's *Life of St. Gregory of Sinai* as a Source for the Origins of Palaiologan Hesychast Practice

### Jesse W. Torgerson *University of California, Berkeley*

During the early fourteenth century, the ancient Christian mystical tradition of hesychast monasticism underwent a significant revitalization in practice that resulted in doctrinal developments significant for the "Byzantine Commonwealth" for centuries to come, but also for Palaiologan society at the time. The actual origins of this renaissance of mystical practice have remained somewhat obscure to historians beyond being linked with the figures of Gregory of Sinai and the more famous Gregory Palamas.

One of the most important texts to narrate the early development of this movement is the *Life of Gregory of Sinai* by the Patriarch of Constantinople Kallistos I; however, Kallistos's purpose for composition led him to construct the narrative of hesychasm's reappearance so that the origins of its sudden popularity and importance in the fourteenth century are unconvincingly explained. Explicating the specific argument that Kallistos made to his readers reveals a reason for obscuring the origins of the hesychast revival, as well as a likely date of composition and the probable intended audience.

Through the early part of the *Life*, Kallistos described the tragic state of a contemporary monasticism whose highest calling, hesychasm, had completely disappeared. This situation was rectified only through the Holy Spirit's descent upon the one soul, Gregory of Sinai, worthy to bring this practice of contemplative eremitism back into the Byzantine *oikumene*. By establishing Gregory of Sinai's special place in the divine plan, and by totally excluding the relationship that another hesychast, Gregory Palamas, had with Gregory of Sinai, Kallistos instead presents himself as the one true disciple.

Among the other key figures of the *Life*, prosopographical study can identify several who have rhetorical implications for the struggles between John VI Kantakouzenos and John V Palaiologos in which Kallistos was involved as Patriarch. A likely scenario is that Kallistos composed the *Life* while in voluntary exile on Tenedos with John V, and that the lessons taught by the *Life* were intended for John VI who both maintained an unjust claim on the imperial title through his son Matthew Kantakouzenos, and had supported the wrong hesychast by listening to the counsels of Gregory Palamas instead of Kallistos.

This proposed context and purpose for the *Life's* composition offers an explanation for the vague description of hesychasm's revival as a monastic practice therein. Further, because of the rhetorical role that the recovery of hesychast practice plays in Kallistos's text, the divinely inspired appearance of the untraceable monk Arsenios to reveal the hesychast way should not be presented as the default storyline but as an origin myth. Positively, this rhetorical use of the origins of hesychasm in the *Life of Gregory of Sinai*, and its presumed effect in the reinstatement of Kallistos I as Patriarch and in John VI's abdication, can be used to illustrate the political implications of "Palamism" in the Palaiologan period and its distinction from hesychasm.

# ORTHODOXY, HERESY AND SANCTITY IN PRE-ICONOCLASTIC BYZANTINE HAGIOGRAPHY

### James C. Skedros Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology

It is generally assumed that one of the effects Iconoclasm had upon the Byzantine Church was a heightened awareness of the distinction between heresy and orthodoxy. Certainly the publication of the *Synodikon of Orthodoxy* in the middle of the ninth century and its annual reading on the first Sunday of Lent bear this out. The strict association of the adjective "orthodox" with the noun *ekklesia* is usually dated to the period following Iconoclasm. This new emphasis on orthodoxy is reflected in iconophile lives of saints written during and after Iconoclasm in which the defense of orthodoxy by the saint serves to authenticate the holiness of the saint. Yet heresy and orthodoxy were not new concepts to eighth- and ninth-century Byzantium. The Byzantine Church had been involved with such issues in the past as reflected in the trinitarian and christological debates of earlier centuries. Were the concerns of heresy and orthodoxy that caught the attention of ecclesiastics and the like important to pre-iconoclastic hagiographers?

This paper examines the extent to which issues of orthodoxy and heresy inform hagiographic literature prior to Iconoclasm. Was the orthodoxy of a saint of central importance in pre-iconoclastic hagiography? How is the orthodoxy of a saint depicted in relation to heresy? An important corollary to these questions is the connection between the orthodoxy of a saint and his or her sanctity. Is the holiness or sanctity of a saint dependent upon his or her orthodoxy? And if so, to what extent? The evidence presented in this paper suggests that the sanctity of the Byzantine saint in the period prior to Iconoclasm is dependent more upon the saint's way of life (his or her *politeia*) and not upon the orthodoxy of the saint. St. Antony, even with a biographer as orthodox as Athanasius, is a saint not because he is a "defender of the faith" but because of a holiness authenticated by his Christian asceticism. Such a conclusion suggests a particular purpose and function for pre-iconoclastic hagiography and indicates an alternative reading to early Byzantine ecclesiastical history in which the emphasis on heresy and orthodoxy is not at the forefront. Rather, evidence from lives of the saints intimates that the great theological debates of the fourth, fifth, and sixth centuries may not have been as important to the faithful as we are often led to believe. The faithful who read (and heard) the lives of the saints were less interested in the orthodoxy of a saint than in the power the saint could offer. It was a saint's holiness and the ability to share that holiness (and spiritual power) with the believer that attracted faithful and that made hagiography the popular genre that it was.

## THE AMBIGUOUS ROLE OF THE BYZANTINE EMPIRE IN PSEUDO-EPHREM'S Homily on the End

#### Jeffrey Wickes University of Notre Dame

The relationship of Syriac-speaking Christians to their Byzantine co-religionists was precarious throughout Late Antiquity. Prior to Chalcedon, Syriac literary voices tended to support the Empire, but a pro-Byzantine stance did not develop into a reified issue per se. Following Chalcedon, and particularly in the sixth and seventh centuries, more defined Syriac voices began to emerge, ranging from outright critiques of imperial religious politics (John of Ephesus) to blatantly pro-Byzantine propaganda (The Julian Romance). The advent of Islam inadvertently distilled these perspectives further. Moreover, the medium of apocalyptic proved a crucial tool for reconciling communities' memories of the past and expectations of the future with the realities unfolding before their eyes. And, inevitably, these events, particularly as they were represented in apocalyptic literature, afforded Syriac Christians an opportunity to reflect upon their own relationship to the Byzantine Empire. This paper focuses on a particular apocalyptic homily composed in Syriac in seventh-century Northern Mesopotamia, falsely attributed to Ephrem. Typically consulted for its allusions to early Islam, the presence of Byzantium in the homily is equally worthy of consideration. Lacking any explicit imperial critique, the homily nevertheless portrays the Byzantine Empire in an ambivalent manner. While the author envisions the Empire's rule as coextensive with peace, the Byzantium of his vision is notably impotent, and absent from ultimate end time action. In this paper, I first offer a cursory treatment of Syriac literary perspectives on Byzantium, followed by a literary and rhetorical analysis of Pseudo-Ephrem's work as a whole. I then compare the work to other apocalypses composed during the seventh century (primarily Pseudo-Methodius and John bar Penkaye) so as to highlight the uniqueness of Pseudo-Ephrem's perspective on Byzantium. Finally, focusing on the presence of Byzantium within the homily's overall argument, I enquire after the particular stance towards the Empire our author aims to promote. Ultimately, does his portrait undermine or undergird the Byzantine Empire?

### **SESSION IX**

Chair: Kostis Kourelis Clemson University

# Cyprus: Archaeology, Architecture and History - VIC 112

Justin Leidwanger *University of Pennsylvania*Structure and Scale in the Maritime Economy of Early Byzantine Cyprus

William Caraher
University of North Dakota
R. Scott Moore
Indiana University of Pennsylvania
David K. Pettegrew
Messiah College

Across Larnaka Bay: Recent Investigations of a Late Antique Harbor Town in Southeast Cyprus

Amy Papalexandrou *University of Texas at Austin*Contextualizing the Tomb: "Bowl Burials" from Polis, Cyprus

#### STRUCTURE AND SCALE IN THE MARITIME ECONOMY OF EARLY BYZANTINE CYPRUS

### Justin Leidwanger University of Pennsylvania

In a recent discussion, Marcus Rautman (*RDAC* 2000:317-331) used the evidence from survey and excavation on Cyprus to draw attention to the dense settlement and economic prosperity that characterized the island during the early Byzantine era (fifth–seventh centuries). This flourishing "busy countryside" was due in no small part to the island's well-developed maritime trade within the eastern Mediterranean. Such connections not only brought agricultural staples from the countryside to the coasts and beyond, but delivered foreign produce, fineware pottery, expensive architectural marble, and even such mundane products as ceramic roof tiles and cooking wares from larger coastal distribution centers to smaller inland sites like Kalavasos-*Kopetra*.

Despite this economic prosperity that was so dependent on Cyprus's seaborne commerce, the actual merchants and the overall structure of the island's maritime trade during the early Byzantine period have received disproportionately little attention. Nonetheless, marine surveys along limited stretches of the island's coasts since the late 1960s have uncovered considerable traces of the merchants, ships and ports that lay at the heart of this commerce. The present discussion synthesizes survey work from these earlier investigations with more recent efforts around the island's southeast and southwest coasts to form a more comprehensive picture of the busy maritime trade of Cyprus during these centuries—a busy seascape that developed in tandem with the busy countryside.

The available evidence from maritime archaeology suggests three complementary approaches to the early Byzantine maritime economy. First, the underwater ceramic finds at dangerous reefs and promontories (like those investigated at Cape Kiti, and more recently at Cape Zevgari and Cape Greco) allow insight into the relative scale of trade during this period of prosperity and the individual maritime connections that formed the island's larger economic network. Second, a total of eight verifiable early Byzantine shipwrecks off Cyprus (representing half the total number of reported ancient wrecks in the island's waters) elucidate the many small-scale, individual merchants whose local and regional routes formed the heart of this network. Finally, a growing corpus of evidence for simple, closely spaced anchorages—sometimes opportunistic and seasonal, but often along stretches of coastline *not* punctuated by advantageous, naturally sheltered coves—underscores the extent to which rural communities were linked by the sea to the dozen or so larger urban ports that served as redistributive centers during the early Byzantine period.

The pattern that emerges from these ceramic scatters, shipwrecks, and anchorage sites is one of an overall maritime landscape that corresponds closely to its terrestrial counterpart in Rautman's "busy countryside." When, in turn, the distribution and scale of settlement—both urban and rural—changed dramatically by around the end of the seventh century, there was little need for the intricate web of anchorages that had characterized the earlier coastal routes, and little room for the smaller, local merchants who made their living through this complex matrix of local and regional commerce.

# Across Larnaka Bay: Recent Investigations of a Late Antique Harbor Town in Southeast Cyprus

William Caraher University of North Dakota

R. Scott Moore Indiana University of Pennsylvania

> David K. Pettegrew Messiah College

Between 2003 and 2007, the Pyla-Koutsopetria Archaeological Project (PKAP) conducted an intensive large-site survey of a coastal site on the northeastern shores of Larnaka Bay, some 10 kilometers east of ancient Kition. While the last two decades of archaeological work in Cyprus have revealed numerous important late Roman sites, Koutsopetria is one of only a few intensively investigated late Roman sites in the southeast corner of the island. The gridded collection at Koutsopetria, together with ceramic analysis, geological mapping and coring, geophysical prospection, material studies, and previous excavations by the Cypriot Department of Antiquities, have revealed a substantial harbor town in existence from the late fourth to early seventh centuries CE, with some evidence for earlier and later phases. In this paper, we discuss how the intensive investigation of Koutsopetria is producing a variety of results that speak to the development of this regional crossroad site at the convergence of inland and maritime routes. We offer conclusions about the size, chronology, and material character of Koutsopetria in its landscape, as well as the evident relationships between this site and other coastal sites on the island, local inland sites, and the broader Eastern Mediterranean. We also examine the relationship between the development of *Koutsopetria* and the fate of nearby Kition across Larnaka Bay. In the end, we argue that the location and diverse archaeological material at Koutsopetria suggest that the town possessed considerable size and affluence and was deeply embedded in local and long-distance cultural networks in the Late Antique eastern Mediterranean.

#### CONTEXTUALIZING THE TOMB: "BOWL BURIALS" FROM POLIS, CYPRUS

## Amy Papalexandrou *University of Texas at Austin*

Two decades of excavation at the site of Polis Chrysochous, on the northwest coast of Cyprus, have uncovered a wealth of material attesting to the thriving afterlife of the ancient city of Marion (Roman Arsinoë). Princeton University's archaeological mission to Polis has recovered two early sixth-century basilicas situated within the small-scale urban context. The remains of both buildings are substantial enough to offer clear and precise indication of their significance within the life of the local community. The architectural picture is enhanced, in both cases, by the mortuary evidence of surrounding burials: the various modes of accommodating the dead, together with the sheer number of individuals excavated, demonstrate not only the interconnectedness of architecture and burial but also the vitality and longevity of the Late Antique town.

The picture of life at Polis following the Arab invasions is less clear, particularly in architectural terms. The presence of several later buildings attests to continued occupation, but their poor state of preservation has inhibited our understanding of them and, consequently, of the Byzantine and late medieval activity at the site. Of the two basilicas, only one was reused, its walls having been outfitted with an extensive program of frescoes after the ninth century. While the precise form and extent of this building is impossible to determine, the fact of its existence and continued use in later centuries (whether functioning or as a ruin) is apparent from the large number of burials incorporated within and near its walls. Once again, the primary source concerning life in Polis is rooted in the extensive mortuary evidence that has survived more or less intact.

The late medieval burials (fourteenth to sixteenth centuries) from Polis generally take the form of "bowl burials," which is to say that individuals were typically interred with one or more vitreous glaze bowls placed in close proximity to the body (or bodies). They typically contain no other grave goods, and the shaft is articulated with only a few lining stones covered by simple stone slabs. Despite traditional evaluations which have focused on the "poor" or "crude" nature of such burials, current approaches offer insight into the immediate context of the interred individual as well as to the larger issues of social customs, local economy, individual or group/family identity (or lack thereof), and so on. The bowls themselves offer evidence for dating along with ritual practice. The physical relationship of tombs to each other and to nearby walls allows some speculation concerning the surrounding architecture as well as the social status of the deceased. Perhaps most important, careful bio-archaeological study of the human remains now gives us ample information about the individuals who not only died but also lived and worked, ate, played, gave birth, worshipped, struggled, were sick or healthy, and cared for their own dead. In this paper I examine the physical evidence from these tombs in an attempt to contextualize the material both locally and generally with respect to practices in the Byzantine world.

### **SESSION X**

Chair: Sheila Campbell, emerita, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies

### Art History - VIC 115

Karen C. Britt
University of Louisville
For Heaven's Sake: Programs of Decoration in
Early Byzantine Churches of the Eastern Provinces

Anna Tüskés
Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest
The Role of Byzantium in the Dispersion of the
Knot-Motif from Antiquity to Medieval Christian Art

Eunice Dauterman Maguire Johns Hopkins University

What Price Prosperity, Security, and Light?

A Lamp Chain at Johns Hopkins University

### For Heaven's Sake: Programs of Decoration in Early Byzantine Churches of the Eastern Provinces

#### Karen C. Britt University of Louisville

Germanos I, Patriarch of Constantinople, claimed "The church is a heaven on earth wherein the heavenly God dwells and walks..." (Historia mystagogia ecclesiastica, PG 98, col.384; edited version by F.E. Brightman, IThS 9 (1908), p. 257, line 11). This paper examines the manner in which the patriarch's description was visually conceptualized in the churches of the provinces of Palestina and Arabia, and considers the methods employed in the study of architectural decoration in the provinces. In the programs of decoration in early Byzantine church interiors, scholars have commonly assumed that the surface decoration of the buildings was arranged hierarchically with the most significant imagery placed on the ceilings, vaults and walls and the least important on the floor. Yet, the relationship of the decoration of the walls and ceiling to the floor in early Byzantine churches is difficult to determine because the superstructures of the buildings rarely survive. Nonetheless, literary and archaeological evidence indicate that a pivotal transformation occurred in the conception of the church interior between the pre- and post-Iconoclastic periods which renders such a hierarchical interpretation incorrect. However, in most cases, the archaeological evidence and literary sources cannot be correlated; they attest to artistic trends in different regions and, therefore, are only general indicators. The provinces of Palestina and Arabia represent an exception. For this region there exist both contemporary literary descriptions as well as substantial archaeological evidence for early Byzantine churches.

A number of scholars have examined the multitude of floor mosaics discovered in this region, and, recently, an effort has been made by some to interpret the pavements within a broader historical context. While the results of this shift in approach have been enormously fruitful, it is important to bear in mind that the pavements were simply one element in the decorative programs of churches and, therefore, functioned as part of an ensemble. As a case study in both interpretation and methodology, this paper will focus on the ways in which interconnections between the Catecheses of Bishop Cyril of Jerusalem (ca. 350) and the physical remains of several church interiors in Palestina and Arabia can enhance our understanding of the role of interior decoration in creating a "heaven on earth." Only through a panoptic approach—one that considers architectural decoration, liturgical furnishings, and ritual activity—to the church interior, an environment in which function and symbol merge, can an attempt be made to discern the meanings of the overall programs and their impact upon the sensory experiences of the faithful.

# The Role of Byzantium in the Dispersion of the Knot-Motif from Antiquity to Medieval Christian Art

#### Anna Tüskés Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest

The focus of the present study is a little-researched motif found on the bottom corner of the hanging garments of figures in painting and sculpture. This motif, which resembles a knot or a tassel, seems to have appeared first on Greek and Etruscan artworks. It was in Byzantium that the motif was first utilized in Christian imagery, and it was due to Byzantine influence that it was transferred to Italy in the thirteenth century. Focusing on the role of Byzantium in the process, this study aims at tracing the dispersion of the knot-motif and providing possible interpretations for its meaning.

In Greek, Etruscan and Roman art, the knot seems to have appeared in two ways. On vases and statues depicting standing figures, knots appear on the bottom corner of cloaks. Such artworks served as devotional objects; they portrayed gods or imperial families. Alternatively, on statues of the seated Zeus, the knot appears on the garment between the knees. In both cases, the knot-motif seems to be associated with proximity to the gods.

It was this meaning that surfaced in Byzantium along with both of the above types of representations in the ninth century. The knot was used to emphasize importance and divinity. This is the case on miniatures (e.g. the portraits of the seated Evangelists and the standing Authors of the Acts of Apostles and the Epistles from the New Testament manuscript in the Escorial Library), ivory carvings and mosaics (e.g. the Dormiton of the Virgin in the Daphni Monastery) with knots, which all followed antique patterns.

Byzantine influence is revealed in the appearance of the motif in the Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem and on the "crusader" icons of the Monastery of St. Catherine on Mount Sinai. In Italy, it occurred for the first time in the mosaics of Venice and the Monreale Cathedral. In both cases, its emergence can be linked to the arrival of Byzantine artists. In *duecento* Italian representations, the usage of the knot was extended from seated Christ-figures and standing figures of saints echoing antique patterns to the Virgin Mary's *maphorion* and the loincloth of Christ. While around 1290 knots disappeared from Italian art, they continued to surface on thirteenth- and fourteenth-century icons in Byzantium and the Balkans. In Europe, the motif re-emerged in the fifteenth century with the rediscovery of antique traditions.

The overall interpretation of the knots as symbolizing proximity to gods is tinged by ancient Greek and Roman traditions regarding knots as talismans offering protection against evil and as representations of evil forces. Knots, if regarded more as tassels, might be also associated with the *tzitzit*, a reminder of God's commands. These observations support the suggestion that knots on garments are associated with transcendental, religious powers.

Borrowing this motif from antiquity and applying it to Christian imagery was the step which allowed the knot to embark on a considerable career. This step took place in Byzantium, making the motif a part of the world's Byzantine heritage.

# What Price Prosperity, Security, and Light? A Lamp Chain at Johns Hopkins University

### Eunice Dauterman Maguire Johns Hopkins University

As inventory work in the Johns Hopkins University Archaeological Collection progresses, hitherto unnoticed Byzantine objects continue to appear. An added stimulus in 2007 has been the search for suitable objects for a student exhibition on the interpenetrating concepts of magic and religion in popular practice. Exploration of storage shelves containing a miscellany of copper alloy tools and implements including medical probes and handles detached from Roman vessels discovered a corroded suspension chain that appeared to be a good candidate for the exhibition as well as for a Byzantine attribution.

One end of the chain supports a strapwork hook fashioned of sheet metal. Integrally inserted into the length of the chain at repeated intervals are three coin-like medallions. In their present condition it is difficult to read any of the images on these medallions, even with the help of magnification. Yet an understanding of the images offers the best hope of situating the chain culturally and chronologically.

The first step in studying the object was therefore a collaborative examination at the Walters Art Museum. We chose the chain as one of several metal objects to consider with conservators Meg Craft, Julie Lauffenburger, and Terry Weiser. Under 60-power magnification, their binocular microscope projected the images of selected areas onto a screen for group discussion. We looked at the medallions in order to see the details of their relief, for remains of the images, and for the outer edges and borders.

A key question is whether these medallions can be identified as actual coins. If not, could they be Byzantine imitations of coins? Their off-centered shapes and their raised borders suggest that they are coins, yet their origins, dates, and mints are not easy to identify. If they are not actual, minted coins, the question is are they copies made by casting coins as models, or are they Byzantine facsimiles, made as coin-like approximations, a principle well known in Byzantine gold jewelry and in the borders of the ivory-clad boxes known as "rosette caskets."

The images on fictive coins are in themselves an interesting subject of study as generic signs of prosperity and as evocations of imperial protection. Images associated with physical protection would be especially propitious on a lamp chain because a lamp, burning costly oil, offers protective light. Yet a lamp can also start an accidental fire. Byzantine lighting fixtures of many kinds therefore offer a rich and long-lived repertory of propitious and defensive imagery, in bronze, in silver, and even in clay. Many of these images play with the popular links between wealth and brightness. This paper investigates parallels between the lamp-chain and other objects in the context of physical sources of light, such as a triple suspension chain for a Byzantine polycandelon in the Metropolitan Museum of Art. It considers the possibility that the unfamiliar iconography of the coin-like disks may be the result of Slavic or Latin attempts to imitate Byzantine coins.

#### **SESSION XI**

Chair: Isabelle Cochelin *University of Toronto* 

### Monasticism and Messianism - VIC 112

Jennifer L. Ball
Brooklyn College
The Monastic Habit

Steven Bowman
University of Cincinnati
The Monarch and the Messiah:
Tenth-Century Jewish Counter-Propaganda

Debra Foran *University of Toronto*Who Is Your Neighbor? Monastic and Lay Communities
at Ma'in, Jordan, in the Early Byzantine Period

Richard Payne
Princeton University
Christian Elites and Ecclesiastical Factionalism in
the Sixth-Century Sasanian Empire: The "Reforms" of Mar Aba

#### THE MONASTIC HABIT

#### Jennifer L. Ball Brooklyn College

While it is well known that monks and nuns wore a monastic habit, a *schema*, consisting of a cowl and a scapular for the males and a himation, cloak and *skepe*, for females, it is virtually unknown what this really looked like. Furthermore, details such as how often it was worn and for what occasion and whether it was uniform within a single monastery are just a few questions that are not easily answered. Of the sixty-one monastic *typika* published by Thomas and Hero less than half even mention a habit in their rules. Of those only ten indicate anything of what the garments looked like, and then only briefly. Stories of the lives of saints, histories and other monastic documents give descriptions here and there from which to glean information about the habit, but hardly anything complete. Finally, there is the problem that the term *schema* is also used to describe the monastic life, so when descriptions of the clothing exist they are often symbolic or hyperbolic as a metaphor for the modest lifestyle within the convent or monastery.

Through an examination of literary descriptions and portraits of monastics, this paper attempts to broaden our understanding of the *schema*, and the role it played in the monastic life. While prescriptions exist as to fabric and color, portraits suggest that great variety existed within this rubric. Despite rules concerning modesty, so many exceptions were made that vows of modesty were meaningless for some. Because Byzantine monks and nuns were not organized in orders and did not wear a uniform, as they did in the west, it is often assumed that the habit is an almost generic, drab set of clothes, following the codified images of monks and nuns seen in manuscript illuminations. However, attention to a vast number of images of monastics demonstrates regional similarities, which may have constituted a monastic uniform based on locality.

The average Byzantine easily identified monks and nuns outside of the monastery, if literary sources are to be believed. The *schema* however, when mentioned, seems to be a ceremonial garment, leaving us wondering what nuns and monks were wearing that was so identifiable by the Byzantines. The everyday and workclothing of monks and nuns was distinguishable from lay Byzantine garments primarily in color, and less often, in fabric.

#### The Monarch and the Messiah: Tenth-Century Jewish Counter-Propaganda

### Steven Bowman University of Cincinnati

The official propaganda of Byzantium defined the *basileus* as Imperator and Pontifex Maximus, that is, head of state/army and church. Byzantine law codes defined Judaism as a legal corporation and its followers as a restricted minority who were excluded from participation in many facets of the society, i.e., government and military service, law and university, etc. During the sixth through the tenth centuries there were four attempts to forcibly baptize Jews as part of imperial policy. Since church officials refused to sanction such conversions, each persecution was eventually cancelled. In the wake of the last persecution by Romanos Lekapenos, an anonymous Jewish response to Byzantium appeared in southern Italy in the form of a history of the Second Temple period that is unparalleled in its historical sophistication and in its contribution to the renaissance of the Hebrew language that was now several centuries in development. That history is known as *Sefer Yosippon* or the *Book of Joseph ben Gurion Ha-Cohen*.

This paper examines the counter-Byzantine propaganda embedded in the author's reworking of the *Jewish War* of Flavius Josephus and its later Christianized version in the *De excidio urbis Hierosolymitanae* of Pseudo-Hegesippus. His satirical parodies and playful imagination are based on a sound yet creative approach to the reading of historical and midrashic sources into which he embeds his response to the animosity of the Byzantine state and church. In particular Byzantine supersessionism is challenged in the author's treatment of the origins of ancient Roman monarchy, Herod the Great, and the messianic figures of Judah the Maccabee, Jesus, and Flavius Josephus. These and other examples are examined in the paper. *Sefer Yosippon* was to be a major influence on Jews (in Hebrew) and non-Jews (in various translations) for the next millennium as a nationalist statement of Jewish identity.

# Who Is Your Neighbor? Monastic and Lay Communities at Ma'in, Jordan, in the Early Byzantine Period

### Debra Foran University of Toronto

Much of the archaeological work conducted in the Madaba region has focused on remains from the early Byzantine period. These investigations have revealed numerous urban settlements and a complex network of monastic communities. After careful study of these monasteries, a regular settlement pattern emerged. These religious communities frequently established themselves very close to inhabited areas. Although considerable attention has been given to these ecclesiastical remains, comparatively little has been paid to the lay communities that supported the church and the relationship between these two groups.

The site of Maʻin, a significant urban centre on the Madaba Plateau, is located approximately 8 km south of Madaba. Perched on a bedrock outcrop at the top of the Wadi Zarqa Maʻin, the site commands an impressive view of its immediate surroundings. To date, three churches dating to the sixth and seventh centuries have been excavated. These remains attest not only to a flourishing Christian population but also to a monastic presence at the site.

An archaeological survey was undertaken at Ma'in during the summer of 2006. The long-term objective of this project is to investigate the Byzantine settlement at the site and the relationship between the secular and religious communities. The initial topographic survey revealed a typical *tell*, suggesting significant cultural material accumulation. This accumulation is not evenly distributed across the site as bedrock is clearly exposed in several places, particularly on the southern slope.

A surface collection survey accompanied the topographical investigation. Every area surveyed produced Byzantine material, but the highest concentrations were found at the summit and on the southwestern slope. The church of al-Dayr, excavated by Fr. Piccirillo in the 1970s, was also investigated during this preliminary phase of the project. It overlooks the large *wadi* to the south of the *tell*. A cursory survey of this *wadi* yielded a number of caves, including one with plastered walls. The second phase of this survey project (to be conducted during the summer of 2007) will concentrate on this *wadi* system in the hopes of elucidating the relationship between the installations on this valley and the small monastic church to the north.

The numerous mosaic inscriptions of the Madaba region reveal a strong connection between the local monastic and lay communities. This relationship, however, has never been examined archaeologically.

# CHRISTIAN ELITES AND ECCLESIASTICAL FACTIONALISM IN THE SIXTH-CENTURY SASANIAN EMPIRE: THE "REFORMS" OF MAR ABA

### Richard Payne *Princeton University*

Sasanian society is usually described as a world of religious communities united in doctrine, guided by their respective hierarchs, and governed by religiously inspired laws. This interpretation, however, is based on the representations of the religious leaders themselves, whether inscriptions of Zoroastrian mobadhs or martyrologies of Christian clerics. The cluster of sources surrounding the career of Mar Aba, the catholicos of the Church of the East between 540 and 552, provides an opportunity to read against the grain of what might be termed the rhetoric of insularity or rhetoric of religious community. For in this case we are uniquely privileged in possessing not only the *History of Mar Aba*, but also his canons and canonical letters. These sources enable the contextualization of one religious leader's deployment of the rhetoric of religious community at a crucial juncture in the development of distinctively Christian legal institutions.

The primary challenge of Mar Aba's catholicate was to pacify the factionalism that had typified the Church of the East in the sixth century. Rival parties in the principal ecclesiastical sees vied for control of the ecclesiastical hierarchy, each supporting their own bishop. While scholars have often pointed to linguistic divisions as the cause of factionalism, the canons of Mar Aba raise the possibility of placing ecclesiastical factionalism within the context of the politics of kinship that characterized Sasanian urban society. It was alliances between noble families and the church hierarchy in some cities that placed them in opposition to the central authority of the catholicos.

For Mar Aba's legislation is overwhelmingly concerned with the relationship between laymen and clerics and with the engagement of laymen in practices characteristic of the Sasanian nobility, whether Zoroastrian or Christian. His canons targeted clerical fosterage and consanguinous marriage. While these have previously been viewed as a reflection of an autonomous Christian legal system, there is in fact little evidence to suggest that they are anything other than novel claims. Mar Aba devised these canons not to provide updated guidelines to ecclesiastical judges, but rather to reform the Christian elite. He deployed the most valuable asset a Christian cleric possessed—the ability to define and redefine the term "Christian"—with a view towards renegotiating the role of prominent laymen in the Church of the East.

The *History of Mar Aba* has preserved traces of the Christian nobles' response to Mar Aba's legislation and alerts us to the presence of Christians at court who participated in the Zoroastrian mobadhs' accusation and interrogation of the catholicos. Although discussions of Mar Aba's so-called persecution have explained his imprisonment as a consequence of his conversion to Christianity from Zoroastrianism, it was an alliance between Christian nobles and Zoroastrian hierarchs at court, who were equally opposed to his attempt to redefine the boundaries between Christian and Zoroastrian nobles, that led to the persecution of Mar Aba. Future research on Christians in the Sasanian empire might benefit from focusing on the relationship between lay nobles and ecclesiastics, rather than on a Zoroastrian/Christian binary.

#### **SESSION XII**

Chair: Heather Grossman University of Illinois, Chicago

### Identity and Art - VIC 115

Monika Hirschbichler
Washington, D.C.
Constructing Identity: Cultural Definition in the
Wallpainting of Frankish Greece (1204-1311)

Marina Karem

Louisville, Kentucky

The Genesis of a Venetian Style in the Last Judgment Mosaic in the Cathedral of Torcello

Elena Dana Prioteasa

Central European University, Budapest

The Apostle Bartholomew in Transylvanian Orthodox Churches:

A West-Inspired Devotion to the Saint?

Jens T. Wollesen

University of Toronto

The Frescoes of the Royal Chapel at Pyrga on Cyprus:

New Evidence and Problems

#### Constructing Identity: Cultural Definition in the Wallpainting of Frankish Greece (1204-1311)

### Monika Hirschbichler Washington, D.C.

This paper outlines forms of cultural definition and demarcation in the heterogeneous society that developed in Greece as a consequence of the Fourth Crusade. The special brand of multiculturalism that flourished in the Crusader states throughout the Mediterranean promoted cultural exchange and cross-fertilization. At the same time it served as a catalyst for communal self-definition and, at times, the deliberate shaping of new cultural identities. In the case of Frankish Greece, this process of interaction, demarcation, and identity building can be observed on the painted walls of over twenty monuments that were decorated between 1204 and 1311 in the Crusader territory that was known as the Duchy of Athens. Scattered across an area that incorporates the greater part of the Peoloponnese, Boeotia, and Attica the murals express a striking range of religious opinion, political allegiances, and cultural affiliation. They highlight religious disparity and contain attempts at cultural and political re-definition, but they also display points of convergence and mutual recognition. Distinctions were not always drawn along expected lines. A monument Frankish in both conception and message might be rendered in the pictorial language of the Greek tradition. Equally, a church program could incorporate Western elements in one part of the decoration while insisting on its Orthodox tradition in others. Boundaries were drawn when the circumstances called for such a differentiation, but at the same time visual forms could cross cultural divides without affecting the basic meaning and function of the overall decoration. Many of the paintings under investigation challenge traditional notions of cultural interaction that are based on two-dimensional concepts such as influence and compliance. In doing so, they document the complexity of Crusader society and highlight the shifting nature of identity, cultural, communal, or otherwise. Combined, the decorated monuments of Frankish Greece paint a picture of a surprisingly nimble society that adapted to the ever-changing cultural and political landscape of the medieval East.

### THE GENESIS OF A VENETIAN STYLE IN THE LAST JUDGMENT MOSAIC IN THE CATHEDRAL OF TORCELLO

### Marina Karem Louisville, Kentucky

Scholars who have examined the activities of Byzantine artistic schools in the provinces proposed that several national workshops were formed soon after an initial contact with Greek artists. Among the earliest proponents of this theory is Victor Lasareff in "Costantinopoli e le scuole nazionali alla luce di nuove scoperte" (1960), where he proposed that from the beginning of the twelfth century the mosaics of St. Mark in Venice displayed the emergence of an autonomous style.

My study re-examines the question of the transmission of styles and the blending of artistic currents in medieval Venice. Rather than St. Mark's, I focus on the Last Judgment mosaic in Santa Maria Assunta in Torcello, dated to the late eleventh and early twelfth centuries. My study has been clarified by the scientific analysis of the construction materials by Irina Treadgold in the 1970s. Her chronology facilitates an understanding of this work in its historical and cultural framework.

While the exact date is unknown, the execution of the mosaic could have begun only after 1008, for it was in that year that the reconstruction of the original 639 cathedral was completed. In the following decades, the relationship between Venetian and Byzantine rulers was quite close and intensified after Doge Domenico Selvo (1071-1084) married the sister of Michael VII Ducas. Selvo's successor, Vital Faliero, helped Alexius Comnenos in his fight against the Normans in Sicily. In gratitude, the emperor bestowed on the doge the title of *Protosebastos* and awarded the Venetians extraordinary trading advantages over their competitors. This gave a tremendous boost to the Venetian economy.

I propose that between 1008 and 1118, when the relationship between Venice and Constantinople was at its best, at least two Greek teams were active in the execution of the Last Judgment mosaic. However, stylistic differences suggest that Venetian artists were working alongside the Byzantine mosaicists. The bottommost register of the mosaic exhibits a new style, with smaller, more numerous and more active figures. Documentary evidence indicates that, even during this period of harmony, a mutual distrust existed between the two cities. This is reflected in the formation of autonomous workshops in which Venetians required that each Greek master active in the city should also train two Venetian apprentices. This arrangement may explain the gradual blending of styles in the Last Judgment mosaic.

In 1117 an earthquake slightly damaged the mosaic, which was still incomplete at that time. Two years later, a split in the relationship between the Byzantine Empire and Venice resulted in the expulsion of all Greeks (including artists) from Venice. I contend that the lowest register of the mosaic, which postdates 1117, can only be the work of Venetian artists.

### THE APOSTLE BARTHOLOMEW IN TRANSYLVANIAN ORTHODOX CHURCHES: A WEST-INSPIRED DEVOTION TO THE SAINT?

#### Elena Dana Prioteasa Central European University, Budapest

Situated in the Hungarian Kingdom and inhabited by Hungarians, Germans, and Romanians, medieval Transylvania was a place of close interaction between Western and Eastern cultures. Relatively few sources have been preserved to reconstruct the social, political, and religious life of the Romanians, who were Orthodox. Among these sources are the late medieval wall paintings in Orthodox churches, which have not yet been fully explored. The wall paintings in Orthodox churches display a challenging mixture of Byzantine tradition and Western influence. The attempt to understand the iconographic peculiarities can contribute to our knowledge of the religious life of the donors.

One of the iconographic oddities is the depiction of a Western iconographic type of Saint Bartholomew. The apostle, depicted as a naked flayed man, carries his skin on a staff over his shoulder. In his other hand he holds the knife, the instrument of his martyrdom. Saint Bartholomew appears with this iconography in the sanctuary of the church of St. Nicholas at Hălmagiu/Nagyhalmágy (painting from the first half of the fifteenth century), and in the nave of the church of St. Nicholas at Densuş/Demsus (painting from 1443 or earlier). The same iconographic type appears in a few medieval Catholic churches in the Hungarian kingdom, now situated in Transylvania (Romania), and Slovakia. Other examples, from wall paintings in Bohemia and Austria and one from a manuscript from Istria, suggest that this iconographic type, considered a rarity in reference works, was quite well known in particular regions of central Europe. Examples range from the middle of the fourteenth century to the middle of the fifteenth century.

The cult of Saint Bartholomew in the West included his veneration as a protector of various occupations, among others shepherds and leather workers. His cult also seems to have been related to the penitential spirituality and the special devotion to the suffering Christ and the Eucharist in the late Middle Ages in the West. Starting from the peculiar depiction of the saint in Orthodox churches, one can argue that the Romanians in Transylvania might have adopted particular aspects of the saint's Latin cult.

#### THE Frescoes of the Royal Chapel at Pyrga on Cyprus: New Evidence and Problems

Jens T. Wollesen *University of Toronto* 

The fresco decoration of the Royal Chapel at Pyrga is usually dated 1421, during the reign of King Janus and Queen Carlotta. The coat of arms featuring the Cross of Jerusalem and the lion rampant point to the royal pedigree of this chapel, namely to members of the Lusignan dynasty. The royal French patronage left its imprint on this chapel in terms of architecture and pictorial decoration, although within a complex Cypriot frame. The paper presents evidence that supports a much earlier dating into the first half or the middle of the fourteenth century. The decoration would, then, be the only extant Lusignan commission in the earlier fourteenth century on Cyprus. The decoration of a private (royal) chapel on Cyprus was, as far as we know, a new but local task with no repercussions beyond its location, challenging both painters and patrons.

The choice of scenes—their contents described with French *tituli*—does not specifically adhere to any given model repertory or scenario on Cyprus. There is no consistent model pattern, even though many scenes and saints in Pyrga belong to a rather established narrative repertory of Cypriot church programs, such as in Asinou. Obviously, very specific choices in this respect were made for Pyrga. It is, however, the particular location of scenes and saints, as well as significant western additions and variations that distinguish this Lusignan program from its indigenous Byzantine, and Cypriot predecessors.

A brief iconographical analysis shows that the workshop used a variety of pictorial sources. Various elements relate to frescoes in Asinou and Pelendri which are perhaps datable around the first third or the middle of the fourteenth century. Others strongly suggest a knowledge of earlier Palaiologan Constantinopolitan monuments, such as, for example, the Kariye Djami mosaics and frescoes of the first third of the fourteenth century. Certain iconographic parallels and peculiarities, such as the reversed position of the Mary and Christ fresco panels flanking the west door, may indicate some familiarity with the mosaics and frescoes of that church. However, these references then were westernized.

The emotional pathos and certain elements in the frescoes of the *Crucifixion*, the *Lamentation*, and the *Descent from the Cross* suggest an awareness of French source material, and in particular of Franciscan book illuminations, Psalters, Missals, and Books of Hours. The Franciscan references, in my view, are important, since the patrons of the Pyrga decoration seem to have had strong ties with that order. The Palaiologan Constantinopolitan, but also the French/Italian, stylistic background of the Pyrga frescoes strongly advocate a date of their execution in the first half of the fourteenth century. This decoration would be outstanding indeed: as a royal commission it would witness the first and most faithful adoption and adaptation of Palaiologan models in Cyprus, presumably in the first third of the fourteenth century, either toward the end of the reign of Henry II (1285-1324), or of Hugh IV of Lusignan, ruling between 1324 and 1358, both kings of Cyprus and Jerusalem.

### **SESSION XIII**

Chair: Alice-Mary Talbot Dumbarton Oaks

#### Saints - VIC 112

Hallie Meredith
Bard Graduate Center, New York
The Mediation of Holy Power in Early Byzantium:
Art in the Life of St. Theodore of Sykeon

Matthew J. dal Santo
University of Cambridge
Revisiting Early Byzantine Piety:
The Cult of the Saints in the Writings of Anastasius of Sinai

Denis F. Sullivan *University of Maryland, College Park*The *Life of St. Basil the Younger* (Tenth Century)
and the Physical and Social Geography of Constantinople

# THE MEDIATION OF HOLY POWER IN EARLY BYZANTIUM: ART IN THE Life of St. Theodore of Sykeon

# Hallie Meredith Bard Graduate Center, New York

This paper examines the role of art in the *Life of St. Theodore of Sykeon*. The text includes several works of visual art, most notably icons, painting, articles of dress and ecclesiastical vessels. Seminal scholarship has focused on icons in early Byzantine art. However, modern scholars do not typically look at figural icons alongside non-figural, utilitarian art, such as liturgical vessels. This work evaluates both in parallel, posing the central question: Why is art in the hagiography?

The *Life of St. Theodore* is peppered throughout with portrayals of vision. Complementing surviving usable art, texts like this one specifically and the textual record more broadly, provide a different way of accessing the range of material culture typically found in ecclesiastical spaces and perceptions concerning the social role of art in sixth-century society. The biographer writes about images in the text in service of his underlying aim, to disseminate the events of the saint's life as a means of attesting to miracles and prompting emulation. How is art used to achieve the biographer's aims? Art is portrayed mediating holy power.

Ekphrasis (textual description creating an image before the mind's eye) was inherited as part of a rhetorical technique with which to foreground objects as part of a narrative. The biographer of the Life of St. Theodore, although not classically trained, still incorporated descriptions of objects as part of a narrative of miraculous events. The evidence offered for the veracity of miracles repeatedly incorporates art.

Within the text, icons are shown to exhibit agency, for example in healing. These painted images are portrayed as mediating gifts of blessings *from* divine figures *to* Theodore at key moments in his life. Whereas the importance of icons has been the subject of seminal art historical work on the period, agency exhibited by non-figural, utilitarian art has perhaps been eclipsed and congruities overlooked.

Theodore is repeatedly portrayed using ecclesiastical lamps as a means of enacting miracles or divining revelations. Whereas in the *Life of St. Theodore* icons are typically a means of representing mediation from beyond this world to Theodore, ecclesiastical vessels are repeatedly portrayed as a means of foregrounding St. Theodore's miracles and the mediation of his holy power on earth to man and emperor alike.

The agency of art is manifest in illustrations of miracles in the *Life of St. Theodore*. In early Byzantium, differentiable categories of material culture signified the mediation of holy power by divine or human agents.

### REVISITING EARLY BYZANTINE PIETY: THE CULT OF THE SAINTS IN THE WRITINGS OF ANASTASIUS OF SINAI

Matthew J. dal Santo *University of Cambridge* 

The "triumph" of the cult of the saints during the fifth and sixth centuries constitutes a standard feature in most accounts of early Byzantine Christianity (e.g., Krueger, 2005). According to Gilbert Dagron (1992), however, Anastasius of Sinai's Questions and Answers (ca. 700) represents an important piece of evidence for scepticism towards the cult of the saints in the late seventh century. Their significance lies in connecting the attack apparently directed towards the cult of the saints in Constantinople during the 580s—as revealed in Eustratius the Presbyter's On the cult of the saints (ca. 582)—to the denunciations made of the saints in the acts of the earliest iconoclastic councils. Arguably, the acceptance of the cult of the saints, among Christians and pagans alike, was less universal than sometimes presented, and there remained throughout the period alternative systems of belief, both within Christianity and outside of it. Although the grounds for Anastasius's apparent reserve towards the cult of the saints have been contested by Krausmüller (1997/98), nonetheless, a comparison of Anastasius's view of the saints' activities and powers with those championed by Eustratius reveals significant discrepancies between the views proposed in the Questions and Answers and the official early Byzantine "orthodoxy" as defined in Constantinople and elsewhere. If this is so, however, how does one explain Anastasius's own hagiographical writings? Flusin (1991) has brought to light two originally separate collections of saintly tales written by Anastasius, apparently during the early decades of the Arab Conquests of the Byzantine Near East. Responding to Haldon's (1992) challenge to integrate the Anastasian corpus into historical accounts of the seventh century, this paper seeks to contextualise both Anastasius's Questions and Answers, and his hagiographical works in order to propose a more nuanced view of the cultural, religious and intellectual history of the early Byzantine Mediterranean.

# THE Life of St. Basil the Younger (TENTH CENTURY) AND THE PHYSICAL AND SOCIAL GEOGRAPHY OF CONSTANTINOPLE

#### Denis F. Sullivan University of Maryland, College Park

The Life of Saint Basil the Younger presents a valuable picture of the physical and social geography of tenth-century Constantinople. We first meet the saint when he is arrested by imperial agents in Asia Minor and brought to the capital. He is interrogated by the parakoimomenos Samonas in the Neos Oikos, "fed" to a lion in the Oikonomion, thrown into the sea near the "current of Barbara," and rescued and taken by dolphins to the Hebdomon. Though said to be a monk, he subsequently lives in private homes, including that of a primikerius, Konstantine Barbaros, in ta Arkadianai, which is near the home of the zoste patrikia Anastasia, and visits numerous others, including that of two senators, the Gongyloi brothers, in ta Eleutheriou.

Basil's reputation grows and he becomes a spiritual advisor and source of cures for numerous diseases for the people of the city. We also hear from his disciple and the *vita*'s narrator Gregory about the Forum Bovis with a chapel of St. Stephen, the Forum Taurus, the road to Blachernai (which for Gregory actually leads him to heaven and a vision), and of incidents in the hippodrome, the palace, etc. In these various vignettes the saint meets the emperor and empress, imperial relatives and officials, businessmen, priests and nuns, foreigners and slaves. We are told that among the palaces of *ta Eleutheriou* above the gate of St. Stephen there is a very large mansion, which some say belonged to the emperor Romanos and in which two of his daughters lived; of John, a eunuch by nature, who had a house near the monastery of St. Lazarus and was assigned to attend at the imperial table; and of a house situated in the harbor of Sophiae, belonging to a certain rich workshop owner. We are told of slaves who live in the forecourt of such houses, others with beds in the basement, of doormen with private rooms, and of household managers or overseers (*epitropoi*).

The paper examines three aspects of locations and activities in the city. First, it examines the accuracy of the physical geography described, the nature of the lesser-known buildings mentioned, and any unstated implications of the sequences of movements—I suggest, for example, that the trip via dolphins from the "current of Barbara" (to be identified as near Seraglio Point) to the Hebdomon is intended to allow the saint to re-enter the city through the Golden Gate, the traditional triumphal entry point. Second, it examines the location of the homes relative to what is known from other sources about which social groups lived in what locations. Finally, it elucidates the construction and room arrangement of the houses, in particular the spatial relations between owners and slaves in such private establishments, again with reference to similar evidence from other sources.

### **SESSION XIV**

Chair: Holger Klein Columbia University

### Archaeology in Turkey - VIC 115

Veronica Kalas

Wayne State University
Yavuz Ozkaya

Architectural Restoration, PROMET, Ankara

The Church of Tigran Honents and the Mosque of Minuchir at Ani

Benjamin Mearns *University of Pennsylvania*Web-Based Mapping of Aghtamar Church and its Surroundings in Eastern Turkey

John Haldon Princeton University Medieval Euchaita and the Avkat Survey Project

# THE CHURCH OF TIGRAN HONENTS AND THE MOSQUE OF MINUCHIR AT ANI

Veronica Kalas Wayne State University Yavuz Ozkaya Architectural Restoration, PROMET, Ankara

The Church of Tigran Honents and the Mosque of Minuchir at Ani stand among the most important buildings of the abandoned medieval Byzantine, Armenian, Georgian, and Seljuk city of Ani in northeastern Turkey. In a campaign to salvage major monuments in eastern Turkey that have been neglected for decades and to bring attention to underdeveloped regions of the country, Turkey's Ministry of Culture and Tourism recently offered a special commission for the preservation of these two structures. During the spring and summer of 2006, Tigran Honents and the so-called mosque were the object of intensive survey by the architectural firm PROMET based in Ankara, and the subject of lively discussions by the faculties of restoration, architectural history, and engineering at the Middle East Technical University. In this paper we present some of the highlights from this study, including the most important drawings and three-dimensional models produced from the survey. We also discuss the ways in which this significant work of primary documentation may lead toward a better understanding of medieval architectural history in the region, especially during the thirteenth century. These buildings testify to a complex period of cultural interactions in eastern Anatolia and the southern Caucasus. We touch on problems of building chronology, technology, and style, and issues of identity, function, and meaning.

#### Web-Based Mapping of Aghtamar Church and its Surroundings in Eastern Turkey

#### Benjamin Mearns University of Pennsylvania

Computer-aided visualizations, often in three dimensions, have found favored status within the Heritage Conservation field. These visualizations are ideal for representing conservation interventions for historical sites to an uninitiated audience. Kennedy (1994) argues that, for community stakeholders, visualizations have provided a window onto the world of the conservationist, that of "proportion, rhythm, scale, palettes of materials and colors, and spatial relationships." Furthermore, conservation professionals have found that once they have initiated the process of compiling digital information such as manuscripts, "sketches, slides, photographs, handwritten notes, and drawings" into a unified system, it becomes a natural organizational tool.

I argue that a web-based geographic information system (GIS) is the next step in this natural progression. This move is amplified by the role of spatial relationships within historical sites, now considered a crucial element for understanding unknown historical events and contexts. This emergent role of the GIS in Heritage Conservation and allied fields is burnished by its growing global following. Guney (2006), for example, describes a web-based GIS designed to manage the historical sites of Ottoman-era Seddülbahir and Kumkale located at the southern tip of the Dardanelles in northwestern Turkey.

The Aghtamar Church is located in that same country but in the southeast, a place wealthy in great historical sites and natural beauty, yet often neglected by economic development. Concerned stakeholders have called upon the University of Pennsylvania to provide guidance for the development of Aghtamar Island and the surrounding region. I describe a web-based GIS that provides three main benefits: 3-D visualizations of critical design interventions in the region, organization of digital site information, and geographically linked web forums intended to gather feedback on proposed interventions and to foster community dialogue.

#### Medieval Euchaita and the Avkat Survey Project

#### John Haldon Princeton University

This paper presents the Avkat Survey Project directed from Princeton University, and summarises results from the first year's fieldwork and research program.

The ancient site of Euchaita (Ottoman Avkat, modern Beyözü since the 1930s, near Çorum in north-central Turkey), seems to have been occupied since prehistoric times. During the Roman period it was a minor rural centre. But from the fourth century it became the centre of the cult of St. Theodore Tiro, and was walled and raised to the status of a bishopric in the early sixth century. Unlike most excavated or surveyed urban or fortified sites of the Byzantine period, Euchaita was never a major metropolis, cultural centre or extensive urban settlement. In contrast, it was a small, if at times strategically significant, provincial town, much more typical of the "average" urban or fortified centre of Asia Minor. Yet we know almost nothing about such places because none has yet been excavated with a view to following such long-term changes. The project links with related regional projects in central Anatolia, and adds substantially to the construction of a middle Byzantine ceramic typology. Archaeology has tended to focus, for a range of perfectly good reasons, on major settlements whose history is relatively well known at least in its broad outlines—Ephesos, Amastris, Pergamon, Ankara, Amorion. Sites such as Euchaita have been largely ignored. A full survey of the site and its wider environs is possible with minimal disturbance to local populations and minimal complications from later settlement. The site and its hinterland offer in addition an outstanding opportunity to establish an environmental and landscape history of the region and to relate this directly to the pattern of human activity across several millennia.

#### **SESSION XV**

Chair: Anthony Cutler Pennsylvania State University

### Islamic Context and Contacts - VIC 112

Eva Baboula *University of Victoria*The Biography of Tamerlane in Greek Sources
of the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries

Alicia Walker

Washington University in St. Louis

In the Absence of Texts:

Medieval Cross-Cultural Exchange as Traced through Objects

Warren T. Woodfin *University of Pennsylvania* Court Art on the Open Steppe: The Enamel Cup from the Chingul Kurgan, Zaporiz'ka Oblast', Ukraine

# THE BIOGRAPHY OF TAMERLANE IN GREEK SOURCES OF THE FIFTEENTH AND SIXTEENTH CENTURIES

### Eva Baboula University of Victoria

Tamerlane (Temür) was born in the region of Samarqand in the 1320s or 1330s. He established his overall command of the ulus Chagatay and set out on campaigns of conquest that took him as far west as Syria and east to the borders of China. He is perhaps best known for his victory over the Ottoman sultan Bayezid I Yildirim near Ankara in July 1402. Tamerlane himself died in 1405 mounting a campaign against Ming China. During the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries biographies of Tamerlane were written in a wide variety of languages both in Europe and in the Islamic world. This paper will examine the contribution of the Greek sources.

Tamerlane appears in a diverse range of Greek source material of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. The most extensive account is given by the historian Chalcocondyles, although other references to the Central Asian ruler can be found in historians such as Doucas and Phrantzes, as well as in Critoboulos's biography of Mehmed II Fatih. Historical accounts of Tamerlane were also produced in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries by Greek émigrés to Italy, most notably Theodore Spandounes.

Some scholars, including Spandounes and Critoboulos probably consulted Turkish sources, but antique geographical and historical writing evidently played a significant role in the interpretation of events in the life of Tamerlane.

The paper will focus upon three main issues: first, what the information within the Greek sources tells us about prevalent beliefs concerning the ethnicity and character of Tamerlane; second, an evaluation of the usefulness of the fifteenth-century Greek sources, particularly Phrantzes, for reconstructing the events following the capture of Bayezid; and third, an overview of the complex interrelationship between Greek and Italian scholarship on Tamerlane in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. Based on the results of an ongoing collaborative research project which is reexamining the available Arabic, Persian, Turkish, and Italian sources, one of the principal conclusions of this paper will be a substantial revision of the reading of Phrantzes. The paper will also examine why Chalcocondyles links Tamerlane to the Massagetae.

# In the Absence of Texts: Medieval Cross-Cultural Exchange as Traced through Objects

## Alicia Walker Washington University in St. Louis

Byzantine-Islamic artistic interaction is an elusive phenomenon not often discussed in contemporary written sources. The passing references that have been noted rarely provide significant information regarding these exchanges. Some medieval works of art do, however, encode cross-cultural artistic appreciation and appropriation within objects themselves. These instances are perhaps most readily apparent in acts of architectural spoliation and adoption of Eastern works of art into Western church treasuries, where portable objects were transformed aesthetically and functionally. Examples commonly involve the assimilation of a previously secular object into a sacred realm. Rarely do works of art move across cultural boundaries while remaining within a purely secular context of meaning and use.

A notable exception to this pattern is a middle Byzantine ivory box currently housed in the treasury of the Cathedral of Santa Maria in Ivrea, Italy. A member of the so-called "rosette boxes," the Ivrea casket depicts figural themes in its main plaques, which are framed by borders of repeating schematized florettes. On the lid frolic acrobats, dancers, and musicians, while on the four side panels bound animals on the hunt. The casket is unique among middle Byzantine ivory boxes, however, because of its gilded bronze attachments: a cross-legged "princely" figure sits amidst the performers on the lid; metal disks, surrounded by the leaping animals, radiate from the centers of three panels; and a hooded figure riding an eagle is positioned over the lock on the fourth lateral side.

The attachments parallel medieval Islamic metal and ivory objects both stylistically and iconographically, indicating that the box was most likely altered in an Islamic context after its initial Byzantine fabrication and prior to its arrival at Ivrea. But this intervention was not a simple phenomenon of decorative embellishment. Rather, the Islamic additions reconfigured the Byzantine scenes of fighting animals and frolicking entertainers into vignettes of the so-called "princely cycle" of medieval Islamic art. While transforming the Byzantine object to participate in a specifically Islamic system of meaning, the box remained within a secular visual language that retained the potential to communicate cross-culturally.

No text describes the process of aesthetic appreciation, cognitive appropriation, and programmatic transformation that the Ivrea casket records. Rather, the metal attachments themselves index these processes. As such, the Ivrea casket offers a rare opportunity not only to trace Islamic adaptation of a middle Byzantine art object, but also to establish some methodological precedent for how these dynamics might be investigated in other objects that show similar evidence of Byzantine-Islamic cross-cultural interaction. My interpretation draws from studies on the transformation of Islamic works of art in Western medieval church treasuries (esp. Avinoam Shalem, *Islam Christianized*, 1996), which consider how mechanisms of mounting, framing, and accretion of precious materials domesticated exotic objects while still maintaining their "otherness," a quality which added to the aesthetic and social value of the work of art in its new context.

# COURT ART ON THE OPEN STEPPE: THE ENAMEL CUP FROM THE CHINGUL KURGAN, ZAPORIZ'KA OBLAST', UKRAINE

# Warren T. Woodfin University of Pennsylvania

In 1981, a team from the Institute of Archaeology of the Ukrainian Academy of Sciences excavated a massive bronze-age *kurgan* in the Zaporiz'ka *oblast* of southern Ukraine. In the course of the excavation, the archaeologists found nine successive bronze-age burials. These ancient finds were overshadowed, however, by a medieval burial, dating to the early thirteenth century, sunk into the preexisting mound and containing the corpse of a nomadic ruler along with five horses, ten sheep, and an impressive array of grave goods. The grave, belonging to the leader of a Kipchak tribe (also known as Cumans or Polovtsy), contained works of Western European, Byzantine, Rus', and Islamic origin including textiles, ceramics, and metalwork.

Among the items of Byzantine origin associated with the Kipchak chieftain was a small silver cup with a loop handle. This was found alongside the corpse, who may have been buried wearing it suspended from his belt. The cup, badly damaged by the collapse of the wooden tomb chamber, was painstakingly reconstructed from the excavated fragments. Although it has been displayed on occasion, this cup has not yet been published. Apart from forming one item in an impressively diverse ensemble of luxury objects, the cup provides us with precious evidence for the practice of Byzantine enamel work after its eleventh-century heyday.

The cup is of deep, ovoid form with a narrow ring foot. Decorative arcading divides the outer surface into six panels, each slightly convex. The upper rim of the cup and the flange of the handle bear foliate ornament. Within the arcades are alternating female figures and trees. Each woman holds a round object in one hand and grasps a trailing part of her costume with the other. Each wears a headdress of differing form. Similarly, the trees, though stylized, clearly belong to three different genera; one, with hanging fruit, is clearly a date palm. The figures and decoration are articulated in an unusual way: the silver has been worked into grooves and filled with colored enamel. While superficially resembling champlevé, the technique is distinguished by the manipulation of a thin metal ground rather than by the removal of material from a thick substrate. The silver ground was most likely entirely gilded, as remnants of gold in the better-preserved portions indicate.

Although it cannot compete with the extraordinary refinement of eleventh-century imperial enamels, the cup from the Chingul Kurgan is important as a rare specimen of Byzantine secular enamel work from the twelfth century. It finds both iconographic and technical parallels as early as the Crown of Constantine Monomachos, which shares with it the iconography of courtly women and trees. A handful of enamels produced between the twelfth century and the Palaiologan era develop the technique, culminating in the repoussé enamel frame of the Mandylion icon in Genoa. With its archaeological context providing a *terminus ante quem* near the beginning of the thirteenth century, the excavated cup can also aid in the placement of the very disparate Byzantine enamels produced in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries.

# **SESSION XVI**

Chair: Jill Caskey *University of Toronto* 

# Lingering Byzantium - VIC 115

Elena N. Boeck
DePaul University

Byzantine Decadence, Ottoman Triumph, and French Orientalism:
Benjamin Constant Constructs Byzantium

Glenn Peers
University of Texas at Austin
A New Cretan Poet in Sixteenth-Century France?
Angelos Vergekios as Pseudo-Philes

Alessandra Ricci
Research Center for Anatolian Civilizations, Koç University, Istanbul
Not Meant as a Coffee-Table Book:
the Description of Constantinople by John Covel (1674)

## Byzantine Decadence, Ottoman Triumph, and French Orientalism: Benjamin Constant Constructs Byzantium

# Elena N. Boeck *DePaul University*

This paper investigates the construction of Byzantium in the paintings of Jean-Joseph Benjamin Constant, a French artist of the second half of the nineteenth century. Benjamin Constant (1845-1902) was a successful Orientalist painter who showed a surprising interest in interpreting historical subjects, most notably Byzantium. This paper analyzes two paintings and their intellectual landscape, *Saint John Chrysostom before the Empress Eudokia* and *The Entry of Mehmet II into Constantinople, 1453*, the first projecting an image of the early Byzantine empire, the latter constructing its final moment.

The first painting creates a tense power relationship between a female ruler and a male saint, and is fascinated with the "Byzantine" apse, replete with saints, a frieze of lambs, elaborate foliate designs (reminiscent of Santa Maria Maggiore), and rich marbles. The opulent garments of the courtiers highlight the "Oriental" richness of the textures, while simultaneously proclaiming the Christianity of the wearers with large crosses. Although the Empress Eudokia is a Christian ruler, she is cast in the mold of a Cleopatra-type seductress. The discussion of the first work analyzes the intellectual positioning of Byzantium as a liminal space: simultaneously Oriental and European, vaguely Roman and strongly alien.

The Entry of Mehmet II into Constantinople was Constant's submission to the Paris Salon in 1876 and was awarded a medal. This rare Orientalist historical work combines violence, triumph, exoticism, and a clash of civilizations. The foreground is richly strewn with corpses, but is equally attentive to an oriental rug, a silver-gilt reliquary, and the shaved head of a murdered priest. The triumphant Mehmet enters the city through a partly destroyed arch decorated with crosses and a barely visible suggestion of a mosaic of the Virgin and Child. Though Mehmet rides as a knight in shining armor, his horse crushes the bodies of partially nude young women under its hoofs. This image allows a European artist to represent a conflict of two alien civilizations: a defeated, decadent Byzantium and an exotic, savage Ottoman force. Both paintings cast Byzantium as a marginally familiar but distant culture, both fascinating and repelling, oriental and decadent. The paper further explores the intellectual context for the production and reception of the two paintings and compares this outsider's attempt to visualize Byzantine history with previous ones.

# A New Cretan Poet in Sixteenth-Century France? Angelos Vergekios as Pseudo-Philes

## Glenn Peers University of Texas at Austin

The work of the Cretan scribe Angelos Vergekios (active 1530s-ca. 1570) as an important agent in the emergence of Paris as a centre of philhellenism needs more study than it has yet received by a small number of excellent and appreciative scholars. Vergekios's hand is discernible in well over a hundred surviving manuscripts of a wide range of Classical and Byzantine works, and it became the basis for the royal movable type script because of the beauty and clarity of the calligraphy. As a major part of the programme of Francis I (r. 1515-47) to gain humanist supremacy on the European stage, Vergekios was one of a handful of educated and intelligent scribes who made this programme a success.

Never disinterested, that programme was highly selective in its attention to the hellenic past, and it was harnessed to larger political ambitions of the French monarchy and elites. It was also never objectively antiquarian, and the forgeries of Vergekios's colleague, Konstantinos Palaiokappas, are well known to those who are interested in the historiography of hellenic studies in the Renaissance west. Noted but never examined are Vergekios's own interventions into the works he was "simply" copying. Vergekios himself took great care over his text, but he was also not above introducing his own readings and elaborations on texts.

This paper is largely concerned with Vergekios's additions to the text he copied more than any other in his career, the poem by the prolific Byzantine poet Manuel Philes (ca. 1275-ca. 1345), *De animalium proprietate*, a versified natural history of some 2,000 lines. The poem exists in two fourteenth-century manuscript exemplars now at Oxford, and its Renaissance versions vary from the Byzantine versions not only in the addition of exquisite illustrations, but also in the invention of more than a hundred lines on the part of Vergekios. This paper then examines the reasons behind this expansion of Philes's work and attempts to place it in the context of Cretan-inspired philhellenism of the sixteenth century.

## Not Meant as a Coffee-Table Book: The Description of Constantinople by John Covel (1674)

## Alessandra Ricci Research Center for Anatolian Civilizations, Koç University, Istanbul

In September of 1674, when the Reverend John Covel, accompanied by his "worthy friends Mr. Dudley North and Mr. Jacob Turner," undertook his survey of the land walls of Constantinople, the monument was certainly not unknown to the Western world. So were the several Byzantine and Ottoman monuments visited and recorded by Covel during his seven years of chaplaincy at the English embassy. Covel's account of Constantinople survives in an unpublished form preserved in an original manuscript, currently held at the British Library (add. 22912) in a format clearly indicating the author's intention of a publication. Although several of Covel's travel accounts of the eastern Mediterranean have been retrieved and used (Nea Moni, Chios; Ephesus; Iznik-Nicaea and more recently Bursa), his lengthy and detailed description of Constantinople does not seem to have attracted the interest of Byzantinists, Ottomanists or even Classicists.

The second half of the seventeenth century in Ottoman history is dominated by the Köprülü name and the failed attempt at conquering Vienna in 1683. The *Rule of Grandees* is the recently proposed reading for this period (Finkel, 2005) contrasted in the 1640s and 1650s by the internal turmoil of the English civil wars with utter social and political confusion deriving from it. How the prolonged stays of "Grandees" within the Ottoman world may have influenced the many Englishmen in their rendering of realities and of the historical heritage remains uncertain. Furthermore, the English sense of cultural, racial and religious superiority and consequent proto-imperialist attitudes (Goffman, 1998) is rarely considered when analyzing the accounts produced.

Traditionally, Byzantinists have used travel literature as a source aimed at measuring the level of conservation or survival of monuments, artifacts and inscriptions (Vryonis, 1980) with scarce interest placed on the historical, cultural and ideological context the same literature originated from.

A first reading of Covel's description of Constantinople gives the impression of being infused with religious undertones accompanied by displays of accurate knowledge and comments on Byzantine primary texts followed by a somewhat primordial Oriental rendering of the city's monuments and urban life revolving around them. However, his descriptions capture not only the lesser-known details of isolated buildings but also the landscape surrounding them with an unprecedented degree of accuracy. For example, his detailed account of the land walls is accompanied by a rare description of what might be rightly interpreted as the historical landscape of orchards and small markets around the monument which characterized its life already in the Byzantine period (*Geoponika* 12.1). While Covel may represent one of the multifaceted Englishmen within the Ottoman world, the value of his observations about Constantinople, a city where he resided for several years, indicates a potential which goes beyond the mere documentation of monuments.



# Performance: The First Annual BSC *Theatron*

Performer: Andrew W. White American University

Among the many issues that arise from our encounters with Byzantium's written works are those of orality and performativity. One of the Byzantine writer's assumptions was that her or his work would be presented before a *listening* audience; in the pre-Gutenberg era the written word's chief function was to fill the aural space between reader and listener, and everything from histories to scripture to poetry was distributed through live readings—through performance. Nowhere was the performance culture of Byzantium celebrated more passionately than in the *theatron*, where circles of educated men (and the occasional woman) entertained each other with monologues, dialogues, letters and fanciful speeches on a wide variety of subjects.

This performance will celebrate the culture of the spoken word in Byzantium through live readings of a wide variety of written works drawn from the Empire's rich history. Selections under consideration include poems, declamations, character monologues (i.e., *ethopoeiat*), satirical hymns, dramas, as well as colorful (and salacious) passages from the histories. Also included will be highlights from the first complete English translation of Choricius of Gaza's *Defense of the Mimes*.

## **SESSION XVII**

Chair: Adam S. Cohen *University of Toronto* 

# Power and Representation in Late Antiquity - VIC 112

Craig H. Caldwell, III

Furman University

The Constantinian Tinderbox: Bassianus, Licinius, and the Destruction of Constantine's Images at Emona

Lynn Jones
Florida State University
When is a Coptic Textile not Coptic?

Rangar Cline *University of Oklahoma*What Shocked Eutropia? Idolatrous Rituals and Christianization at Mamre

Caroline Downing
State University of New York, Potsdam
Theodosius I and the Jewish Community at Stobi

# THE CONSTANTINIAN TINDERBOX: BASSIANUS, LICINIUS, AND THE DESTRUCTION OF CONSTANTINE'S IMAGES AT EMONA

Craig H. Caldwell, III Furman University

The rise of Constantine I to sole imperial rule was a complicated and dramatic part of Byzantine political history, but it was also a process with significant regional implications. In particular, the specter of civil war between Constantine and his rival Licinius affected life in the provinces of the western Balkans by soliciting the support of influential people, sowing monetary confusion and dividing towns such as Emona (modern Ljubljana).

Even though Constantine and Licinius had agreed in 313 to respect each other's territories and rule the Empire in harmony, each emperor was still maneuvering for an advantage. Between 313 and the outbreak of civil war in 316, the western Balkans and northern Italy formed a restless frontier between rival rulers. Constantine sought to win over the Danubian-Balkan provinces to his cause, and Licinius attempted to keep the western emperor in his place. In the midst of this tense situation, Constantine proposed his brother-in-law Bassianus as a new co-emperor, hoping to install him as a buffer between western and eastern spheres of influence. Licinius rejected the idea, but he apparently conspired with Bassianus's brother Senecio to murder Constantine. When Senecio's plot failed and Constantine executed Bassianus, Licinius protected Senecio from punishment. Shortly thereafter, the imperial images of Constantine in the city of Emona were destroyed, and Constantine declared war on Licinius. Can specific references to the regional situation help to make more sense of this series of political events?

Bassianus and Emona were more significant than they have appeared to historians. If we link Bassianus's brother Senecio with an inscription of Aurelius Senecio, a powerful regional commander in the western Balkans around 310, his importance to Constantine becomes clearer. On the border between Constantine's and Licinius's territories, the general Senecio was knowledgeable and influential; his allegiance was a vital "swing vote." From the evidence of the Council of Arles in 314, Constantine was anxious to gain support within Licinius's part of the empire. Similarly, the destruction of images at Emona fits within the regional policy of Licinius. After Senecio failed to eliminate Constantine, Licinius needed to prevent the defection of his western provinces, which had already been "invaded" by Constantine's new gold coinage, the *solidus*. To polarize the local elites, Licinius ordered Constantine's images to be thrown down. Even if the town council of Emona did not support the action, they would expect to face reprisals from Constantine as if they had. The current archaeological picture of Emona, hitherto omitted in discussions of this incident, can further contextualize the events in the region.

No history of the period has sought to draw regional conclusions from the Bassianus affair and the destruction of Constantine's images at Emona. Otto Seeck and Valerio Neri made significant advances in understanding the chronology of events, and Timothy Barnes has further integrated these episodes into the political history of the early fourth century. What the historical picture has lacked is a nuanced exposition of these events, explaining them within the context of the western Balkan provinces.

### WHEN IS A COPTIC TEXTILE NOT COPTIC?

## Lynn Jones Florida State University

The Florida State University Rare Books Collection houses a leather-clad, gold-embossed volume that originally contained 24 so-called Coptic textiles glued onto 22 hardback pages. The book was presented in 1904 to Marie-Auguste Beernaert, Prime Minister of Belgium and co-winner in 1909 of the Nobel Peace Prize. How the volume came to FSU is a mystery. I focus instead on the textiles, which range from the quotidian to the extraordinary. In the latter category is a wool *clavus*, measuring approximately 28 x 4 cm and in a good state of preservation. The technique and the pattern of warp and weft is that found in other Coptic textiles. The *clavus* is decorated with lotus blossoms and two lions, one on each end. The lions have fluffy tails, curled talons, spiral nostrils and long chin-whiskers. These details and others, when viewed in tandem with the lotus motif, suggest that the textile copies Chinese iconography.

To my knowledge there are no preserved textiles bearing the same motifs found on this *clavus*, nor is there anything similar. Such motifs are known from Chinese pottery; the particular type of lion seen on the textile resembles those produced in China during the Tang dynasty (early seventh–early tenth century). Contact between China and Constantinople is known from the early Byzantine period, and trade between China and Baghdad is documented in the mid-tenth century.

At present, this *clavus* raises more questions than it answers. Does the iconography, technique or material offer any clues as to the provenance of the piece? Who wore such a textile? The iconography is not religious—unless the lotus blossoms carried their symbolic meaning from China, a transference for which there is no evidence. The material is not silk, but wool. If, as I argue, the material and iconography point to a middle/merchant class response to the influx of luxuries into the Caliphal court from the Silk Road trade, should we still call the *clavus* "Coptic?" Does the term Coptic automatically link a piece more closely with Byzantium and distance it from Islam and imply a Christian rather than Muslim owner? I seek to introduce this collection, and specifically this *clavus*, to a larger scholarly audience, and to investigate further the issues of transferred motifs and the nomenclature used to classify medieval textiles.

# What Shocked Eutropia? Idolatrous Rituals and Christianization at Mamre

# Rangar Cline University of Oklahoma

Three sources—Eusebius, Socrates, and Sozomen—provide testimony that Hellenes, Jews, and Christians worshipped alongside each other at Mamre in the fourth century because of a shared respect for the tradition of an angelic epiphany at the site. Eusebius and Sozomen record that the Emperor Constantine's mother-in-law, Eutropia, on pilgrimage to the Holy Land (ca. 323), witnessed the religious practices at this site and found the rituals so shocking and idolatrous that she reported them to the emperor. Eusebius, Socrates, and Sozomen record that after Constantine learned of these rites, he sternly rebuked the bishops of Palestine for allowing idolatrous practices at a site sacred to Christianity and ordered a Christian house of worship to be constructed at the site. Our sources offer intriguing observations about Eutropia's visit, the religious practices at Mamre, and the Christianization of the site. However, the sources offer incomplete and evasive descriptions about what Eutropia saw at Mamre, why the emperor moved so decisively to Christianize the site, and the success of Constantine's efforts at Christianization. This paper presents a new reading of these sources and argues that the religious practices that so shocked Eutropia were part of a ritual vocabulary shared by Christians, Jews, and Hellenes. The paper suggests that the reason Constantine and church authorities reacted so swiftly was due to the lack of ritual distinction between Christians, Jews, and Hellenes at the site. Furthermore, the paper argues that Constantine's program for Christianizing Mamre met with limited success. Constantine's building program for Mamre began shortly after Eutropia's visit, as the Bordeaux Pilgrim's account informs us. However, because Sozomen's description of the Hellenic rites at Mamre appears to be based on firsthand knowledge, the paper argues that the "idolatrous" practices Eutropia encountered could still be witnessed at Mamre in the mid-fifth century, over a century after Constantine's efforts to Christianize the site. Furthermore, the Piacenza Pilgrim's account suggests that non-Christians gathered in the courtyard of the Constantinian church to commemorate the visitation to Abraham into the sixth century. The paper concludes by suggesting that in the fifth century, while Sozomen recognized the Hellenic origins of rituals at Mamre, such a pedigree appears to have escaped the concern of the Christian worshippers and Christian authorities at Mamre.

## THEODOSIUS I AND THE JEWISH COMMUNITY AT STOBI

## Caroline Downing State University of New York, Potsdam

The importance of the Stobi synagogue has long been recognized. First discovered in the 1930s, the building contained an important inscription describing the arrangements made by Claudius Tiberius Polycharmos, a wealthy property owner, to give part of his own house to the synagogue. While the inscription contained a date, it was partially illegible, and could be either 163 CE or 280 CE. Numerous painted inscriptions were found during early excavation of the building complex, bearing the same name and the title of "pater" in *tabula ansata* frames. Continuing excavation in the 1970s by the Stobi Archaeological Project uncovered two phases of the synagogue, the latest phase containing graffiti menorahs. In a sewer canal, a menorah and two bronze plaques bearing names were found. One of these names was Eustathios, a name that appears again at Stobi in a dramatically different context.

As is well known, the Emperor Theodosius I visited Stobi in 388, staying long enough to issue two edicts, one of which forbade persons of diverse and perfidious sects to assemble (*CTh* 16.4.2, 16.5.15). These edicts must have had a devastating effect upon the Jewish community at Stobi; certainly it is clear that by the late fourth or early fifth century the Stobi synagogue was systematically dismantled, filled with rubble, and surmounted by a Christian basilica.

During Theodosius's sojourn at Stobi, it would have been natural for the Christian community to create new Christian art to celebrate his presence. I have previously connected Theodosius's visit with the iconography and style of the wall paintings of the Basilica on the Terrace baptistery at Stobi (DOP 52 [1998]). These paintings, and their subjects, are very close in style to Theodosian sculpture known from Constantinople. Several years ago, Macedonian researchers uncovered part of an outer layer of paint on one of the baptistery's semidomes, revealing an inscription referring to the Bishop Eustathios. It is intriguing to speculate whether a prominent Jewish family, seeing the "writing on the wall," converted to Christianity in order to protect its prominent position in society.

# **SESSION XVIII**

Chair: Eric McGeer St. Clement's School, Toronto

# Constantinople - VIC 115

Elisaveta Todorova *University of Cincinnati* Traversing the Bosphorus Before and After the Fourth Crusade

> Örgü Dalgiç Institute of Fine Arts, New York University Saraçhane Mosaics: Reconstructing the Art, Architecture and Topography

Adam Stead
University of Toronto

Meeting-place of the Blue Faction?

A Late Antique Building Complex by the Hippodrome in Constantinople

Kriszta Kotsis
University of Puget Sound
Empress Medallions from Constantinople

# Traversing the Bosphorus Before and After the Fourth Crusade

### Elisaveta Todorova University of Cincinnati

Constantinople's location on the Bosphorus has always been an asset to Byzantium. The role of the Straits in the security and prosperity of the Byzantine capital was almost equal to the challenges it presented when crossing it and even more so to those who navigated the nearly 20 miles of winding stream beset with treacherous currents, winds and waves. Local seafarers had learned long ago to overcome these obstacles, which might have been terrifying to newcomers and called for time and directions to deal with them: thus the Bosphorus was guarded from intruders unprepared to sail its whirlpools.

In this way the gateway to the Black Sea was protected by nature and since the time of Justinian also by the fortress of Hieron; in addition to being a toll station where duty on circulation of commodities was collected, this fortified port served as a beacon and controlled the traffic along the Bosphorus as well. No explicit data about taxation at this place of the state-regulated trade had come down for the period before the Fourth Crusade, despite the fact that the *Book of the Eparch* (among other sources) makes provision for overland delivery of goods from both Asia Minor and Thrace along the seacoast.

How exactly the maritime traffic was controlled before the cannon age is not clear; equally unknown is whether Greek Fire was expedient or whether a small contingent of the Byzantine navy held a patrolling watch there. The surprise Rus' attacks on Constantinople in 860 and later, Alexius Comnenus's silent restriction of Venetian access beyond The City, or Manuel Comnenus's formal ban on Genoese and Pisan sailing into the Black Sea raise more questions than they answer.

Although the Fourth Crusade provided free access and free trade to westerners, Byzantines and local merchants across the Byzantine territories (including the Pontic basin), it did not waive Byzantine financial and military control of the traffic passing through the Bosphorus. And a Genoese attempt to prevent passage by Hieron in the mid-fourteenth century (which, however, backfired) proves the survival of this watchpost until the last century of Byzantium; yet how efficient and effective it was is another story.

The turmoil in the area during the following hundred years or so also affected the navigation along the Bosphorus, which by the mid-fifteenth century was infested with Spanish pirates in the waters of this passage. This fact was used by Mehmet II as an argument for building Rumeli Hisar (or Bogaz Kesen) on the European side, facing the rebuilt Anatolu Hisar on the site of Hieron on the Asiatic coast. Thus, only by guarding both sides of the mouth of the Bosphorus and by using gunpowder weaponry did the Ottomans achieve the control which the Byzantines had somehow managed by relying on the natural conditions and technology available in their time.

# SARAÇHANE MOSAICS: RECONSTRUCTING THE ART, ARCHITECTURE AND TOPOGRAPHY

## Örgü Dalgiç Institute of Fine Arts, New York University

A group of figural and ornamental floor mosaics were unearthed in 1953 during foundation works for the new town hall in Istanbul's Saraçhane district. After their removal to the museum, the site was demolished without proper documentation. A brief article by the site archaeologist, Rustem Duyuran, and a paragraph by J. B. Ward Perkins are the only publications based on site observation.

Since then the mosaics, cut in smaller pieces for lifting, have been waiting in the storerooms, together with the rest of the floor mosaics excavated in various parts of the city. Dozens of pieces lay together like pieces of a giant jigsaw puzzle. Some individual panels appear in relatively recent publications in passing, yet the Saraçhane mosaics were never studied as a group, or in relation to their architectural and urban contexts.

This long-forgotten site presents an unexploited source of information for the topography of Late Antique Constantinople. Its location within the city walls, on a ridge between the Golden Horn and the Sea of Marmara, on one of the city's main arteries aligned with major monuments such as the Philadelpheion, the Capitol, the Thermae Constantinianae, the Valens Aqueduct and the Church of the Holy Apostles, underlines the site's importance in the Constantinian city plan.

The mosaics themselves share features of style and iconography with mosaics of eastern centers, especially Antioch. Together, formal and technical analysis of the mosaics and their building's architectural features confirm a mid-fourth-century date. My firsthand study of these mosaics, careful analysis of the site archaeologists' limited excavation notes, and numerous photos of them still in situ that I found in a private archive, permit a partial site plan. However, this tentative reconstruction, analysis of the ancient and modern topography of the city and the ancient sources suggest that the site in fact belonged to a monumental building rather than a villa as was suggested earlier. An identification of this major monument would fill one of the important gaps in our knowledge of the topography of Constantinople in the fourth century. Understanding of the monument, together with its floor décor, would enhance our understanding of the visual culture of the capital during this important period of great transformations and changes.

# Meeting-place of the Blue Faction? A Late Antique Building Complex by the Hippodrome in Constantinople

# Adam Stead University of Toronto

The monumental Late Antique rotunda and oblong hall located at the juncture of the Mese and the north-south street running along the western flank of the Hippodrome in Constantinople have received a great deal of scholarly attention since their discovery during a series of excavations made between 1952 and 1964. Long identified as the palace of Lausus, Grand Chamberlain (praepositus sacri cubiculi) to emperor Theodosius II (408-450), the building complex has recently been disassociated from this hypothetical fifth-century owner (Jonathan Bardill, "The Palace of Lausus and Nearby Monuments in Constantinople: A Topographical Study," American Journal of Archaeology 101, no. 1 [January 1997]: 67-95). For want of a better identification, the rotunda and adjacent hall continue to be understood, rather uncritically, as the "ceremonial rooms" of a Late Antique palace, even if one might now hesitate to attach it to Lausus (Ken Dark, "Houses, Streets and Shops in Byzantine Constantinople from the Fifth to the Twelfth Centuries," Journal of Medieval History 30 [2004]: 83-107). While the archaeological remains of the complex have much in common with several salient features of Late Antique elite residences both within and outside of Constantinople, typological similarities do not in themselves mean that the complex by the Hippodrome was necessarily a domestic or residential structure. Indeed, we simply know too little about the appearance of Late Antique palatial architecture in the capital to draw any firm conclusions about other, unidentified structures on the basis of typology alone. In this paper, I reconsider the archaeological evidence bearing both on the site and surrounding areas (the neighboring palace of Antiochus [ca. 429-39], the Hippodrome, etc.), highlighting several features of the complex that suggest that it was not a palace but rather a public edifice. Looking to the textual record, which hints repeatedly at the existence of various functional structures associated with the Constantinopolitan circus factions, I propose a possible alternative identification for the rotunda-hall complex, namely as a highly visible, monumental meeting-place for the Blue circus faction.

## Empress Medallions from Constantinople

## Kriszta Kotsis University of Puget Sound

This paper explores three eleventh-century enamel medallions currently embedded in the Khakhuli Triptych in Tbilisi. The roundels, which were most likely produced as a series, represent empresses in the presence of holy figures; the first shows an empress greeted by an angel, the second depicts an empress conversing with John the Baptist, while the third presents two empresses crowned or blessed by the Mother of God. The irregularly shaped plaques contain no inscriptions identifying the figures and appear to have been cut out of their original context. The irregular outlines of the roundels and their cramped compositions suggest that the plaques likely contained identifying inscriptions that had been deliberately removed when they were inserted into the Khakhuli Triptych, divesting the panels from their original identity and fitting them seamlessly into a new Georgian context.

Scholars have suggested both Georgia and Constantinople as places of the panels' manufacture. Similarly, the identifications proposed for the empresses range from Georgian princesses to Byzantine imperial women. This talk will argue that the empresses can be securely identified with Zoe and Theodora of the Macedonian dynasty, who ruled together briefly in 1042, and that the panels articulate the divinely sanctioned rule of the purple-born sisters through a series of personal encounters with holy figures. The paper will also present evidence to substantiate the argument that the plaques were produced in Constantinople.

# **SESSION XIX**

Chair: Vasileios Marinis Queens College CUNY

## Architecture - VIC 112

Suna Cagaptay *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign*The Laskarid Connection: A Few Remarks on the Church of Pantobasilissa (c.1336)

Tassos Papacostas
King's College London
Byzantine, Gothic or "Franco-Byzantine"?
A Re-appraisal of Architecture on Late Medieval Cyprus

Charles A. Stewart *Indiana University, Bloomington*The Multiple-domed Basilicas of Cyprus: Date and Significance

Marina Mihaljević *Princeton University*Uchayak: A Byzantine Church Forgotten

# The Laskarid Connection: A Few Remarks on the Church of Pantobasilissa (ca. 1336)

## Suna Cagaptay University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

The church of the Pantobasilissa (also known as Kemerli Kilise) at Trilye/Trigleia on the Sea of Marmara is an important edifice for late Byzantine architectural developments, as its plan is an unusual variation of the cross-in-square church type. Built of a rough mixture of stone and brick, its facades include notable decorative details in the masonry. In addition, the interior is adorned with a fascinating fresco program depicting scenes from the life of the Virgin.

The church previously had been dated to the late thirteenth century on the basis of its plan, construction and decorative details. Mango and Ševčenko have labeled it a "Mistra church type" (DOP 1973: 235-277). However, recent evidence and re-valuation of the church suggest otherwise. First, dendrochronological research indicates a date for the church after 1336. Second, the church seems to conform not to the "Mistra" type but to fit squarely within the architectural legacy of the Byzantine government in exile, the Nicaean Empire of the Laskarids. Although the Laskarids have left only a few surviving monuments in their major centers in western Asia Minor and Chios, details of the masonry construction closely resemble surviving Laskarid monuments: the church is formed by individual stones often separated by upright pieces of brick inserted in mortar joints. What is more, such masonry consists of five successive courses of brick, alternating with several courses of stone. The following details are further hints for the continuation of Laskarid construction practices in this church: (1) alternating brick and stone voussoirs with setbacks in the circumference of the arches; (2) decorative details such as a dogtooth frieze and a tree-of-life pattern in association with vertical brick patterning on the apse; (3) the longitudinal expansion of the cross-in-square plan into a separate sanctuary with two flanking chapels on the east side. In sum, the construction details may be associated not with Mistra but with Laskarid architectural practices.

Examining the Pantobasilissa within the realm of Laskarid practices amalgamated with local Bithynian characteristics—such as the archaizing triumphal arch scheme recalling the façade articulation in the nearby church now known as Fatih Camii of the early ninth century—should broaden our understanding of the movement of itinerant masons who traveled and mixed with provincial builders during a period which has never been properly explored. Accordingly, this paper aims to provide an analysis of the relationship between the late Byzantine church of the Pantobasilissa and the Laskarid architectural developments within a broader historical context.

# Byzantine, Gothic, or "Franco-Byzantine"? A Re-appraisal of Architecture on Late Medieval Cyprus

# Tassos Papacostas King's College London

The style of a group of church buildings on Cyprus dating from the later fourteenth through the sixteenth centuries has been called "Franco-Byzantine" ever since George Soteriou first used the term in the 1930s with reference to the architectural production of the island's Greek Orthodox Church during the Lusignan and Venetian periods (1192-1571 CE). The main representatives of the group are the now ruinous Greek Orthodox cathedrals of Nicosia and Famagusta, and the much better preserved *katholika* of the Enkleistra near Paphos and of St. Mamas at Morphou. All four are (or were) basilical structures with a dome over the central nave, employing an architectural vocabulary which, notwithstanding considerable variations, is more akin to that of the island's better-known Gothic monuments of the early Lusignan era (thirteenth/fourteenth centuries) than to those of the preceding Byzantine period. None is securely dated by inscription or documentary evidence, but the earliest specimen is thought to be the Famagusta cathedral, founded in the 1360s, the other structures probably dating from the period of Venetian domination (1489-1571).

The ruinous Famagusta cathedral is also the most elaborate and ostentatious member of the group, but among the most problematic too in terms of building phases and their dating. This presentation argues that the superstructure, including the (no longer surviving) vaulting, was rebuilt during the Venetian period according to a scheme that differed significantly from that of the original building. It questions the long-held assumption that the so-called Franco-Byzantine style grew out of a conscious attempt by the Greek Orthodox community to revive its Byzantine traditions by marrying them to the prevailing urban architecture of the period that was heavily imbued with Gothic elements. Instead, it proposes an alternative reading based more on practical rather than ideological considerations.

Used as a case study, the history and architecture of this particular monument brings to the fore several crucial issues related to the art, culture and socio-economic environment of late medieval Cyprus. This is a period that has long been described as one of economic decline and ruthless colonial exploitation, despite several recent valiant efforts to redress the balance and provide a more nuanced assessment based on a sound analysis of the evidence. The foray into the architectural production of the same period proposed here attempts to approach these issues from a different angle, and is germane to current debates about cultural identity, modes of acculturation and cultural appropriation. It is also apposite to the issue of the place and impact of the Byzantine component in the cultural outlook of societies long after the disruption of their political links with the empire.

### THE MULTIPLE-DOMED BASILICAS OF CYPRUS: DATE AND SIGNIFICANCE

# Charles A. Stewart Indiana University, Bloomington

By the mid-seventh century the churches of Cyprus maintained a traditional form. They were simple basilicas covered with wooden roofs. At some point after the Arab raids on the island (ca. 650) several Cypriot churches were reconstructed with a series of three masonry domes along their nave—a design previously unknown to Cyprus. These were some of the most important shrines on the island, housing the relics of the true cross (Stavrovouni) and the bodies of saints Epiphanius (Salamis-Constantia), Barnabas, and Lazarus (Larnaka). Yet scholars have labeled these churches "provincial" and "regional" in comparing them to other churches in the Byzantine Empire. Unfortunately, such labels have been ambiguously defined and have little explanatory power. Such terms, moreover, emphasize the spatial relationship between the island and Constantinople while deemphasizing the problems concerning their period of construction. Without a consensus on their date, the multiple-domed basilicas have been left without a historical context. As a result, previous theories explaining the shift from wooden-roof basilicas to multiple domes have been called into question.

Since history does not record when these churches were constructed, scholars have been left with archeological and art historical means to ascertain their relative chronology. One art historian has argued that these structures date to the period of Justinian I because they have multiple domes like the Holy Apostles (Constantinople) and St. John (Ephesus). Archaeologists such as A. H. S. Megaw and Athanasius Papageorghiou have suggested that they date to the "period of neutrality" (between 650 and 965, when the island was an independent tributary paying taxes both to the Arab Caliphate of Damascus and the Byzantine emperor). More recently, scholars have dated some of the churches to the eleventh and twelfth centuries, suggesting that their form was a result of the Byzantine reconquest (965).

However a recent reassessment of their fabric, coupled with new evidence from excavations, has clarified previously held theories. It has become evident that St. Epiphanius, the archbishop's cathedral, was the earliest church to be rebuilt in this manner. It was erected in the eighth century, about the same time as the vaulted churches of Aphendrika. Moreover, recent archaeological work has shown that the latest church of this type, Saints Barnabas and Hilarion (Peristeronna), was modeled after St. Epiphanius in both design and scale, and was not built later than the eleventh century. With this chronology established, the multiple-domed basilicas can be ascribed to the period of Cypriot independence. While the Empire was torn between monotheletism and iconoclasm, the autocephalous Church of Cyprus retained its conservative Chalcedonian stance. The Church filled in the power vacuum left by the imperial administration, which was weakened by Arab occupation of the island. The clergy, now with both spiritual and earthly authority, commissioned a new church typology which reflected their independence and orthodoxy, as well as Christendom's concerns with liturgical symbolism. This paper provides evidence for their date and explains why the traditional wooden-roof church gave way to the multiple-domed basilica.

### Uchayak: A Byzantine Church Forgotten

### Marina Mihaljević Princeton University

The Byzantine church called Uchayak is situated in the vicinity of the city of Kirshehir, in central Anatolia. The building has a long history of scholarly studies and has been treated as paradigmatic in several now-abandoned scholarly theories. Following the abandonment of the typological method in the study of Byzantine monuments and the rejection of the simplistic concept of "schools" in Byzantine architecture, scholarly interest in the church of Uchayak has declined. The last publication focusing on its architecture dates to 1969, when Semavi Eyice's article brought precious description, valid hypothetical reconstruction, and theories about the patronage and tenth- to eleventh-century dating of the church. Since then, the building seems to have been forgotten. Owing to its remote location, it has rarely been visited by the scholars. Exposed to the elements and the actions of vandalism, the structure has been rapidly disintegrating.

Yet, the architecture of the church of Uchayak leaves space for further considerations. Its plan exhibits a highly ambiguous twin-church arrangement. Both of its adjoining units comprise a square atrophied-Greek-cross naos and an apse preceded by a rectangular bay. Old photographs document the remains of two domes, presumably lost in the 1938 earthquake. A common narthex, remnants of which are now almost completely gone, once spread in front of both naoi. The church undoubtedly had an imposing appearance with its slender proportions and the apex of the dome reaching 17.0 m in height.

The finery of architectural features and excellence of the execution are in general disagreement with Uchayak's remote location and commonly held belief in the inferior quality of provincial architecture. The building technique utilized in its superstructure combines two procedures exemplary for two distinct periods of Byzantine architecture: the wall constructed of pure brick courses with thick mortar beds, characteristic of earlier Byzantine periods, and an upper "slanted" coat of fine reddish plaster, a technique comparable to the shaping of the recessed-brick technique, emblematic of late eleventh- and twelfth-century Constantinopolitan architecture. The exterior of the church displays well-structured and consistent wall articulation including two tiers of tall recessed niches—a decorative system rather avant-garde for our present knowledge of tenth- or eleventh-century architecture. Were it not for the fact that during the twelfth century the Seljuks held the region, such an architectural expression might well be compared to the style of twelfth-century Constantinopolitan buildings.

This paper considers the architecture of the church of Uchayak within a broader context of eleventh-century architecture in the orbit of the Byzantine capital. Structural type and stylistic elements of the church provide an opportunity to ponder the involvement of Constantinopolitan architects and builders. In this respect, the church may appear illustrative of contemporaneous architectural tendencies, evidence of which has perished in metropolitan architecture. The construction technique applied is discussed in terms of its resemblance to the recessed-brick masonry. The long-existing opinion of the imitation of the recessed-brick technique is evaluated in reference to structural and aesthetic performances of both procedures, as well as to its potential purpose in recalling the grandeur of the Byzantine capital.

# **SESSION XX**

Chair: Betsy Moss *University of Toronto* 

## Icons - VIC 115

Bojana Bjeličić-Miletkov *University of Georgia, Athens* An Icon as a Prayer, a Poem as an Icon: The Personal Devotion of a Fourteenth-Century Poetess

Jordan Pickett
University of Pennsylvania
"Heal Us With Your Prayer and Petition":
A Pre-Iconoclastic Image of the Virgin's Dormition

Bissera V. Pentcheva Stanford University
The Miraculous Icon: Medium, Imagination and Presence

Ellen C. Schwartz *Eastern Michigan University*Copper Repoussé Icons: A Preliminary Report

## An Icon as a Prayer, a Poem as an Icon: The Personal Devotion of a Fourteenth-Century Poetess

## Bojana Bjeličić-Miletkov University of Georgia, Athens

The Serbian princess (*despotica*) Jelena Mrnjavčević (ca. 1349-1404), also known as the nun Jefimija, was a poetess who made her compositions integral parts of the precious devotional objects that she commissioned. (One of these objects, the pall for Prince Lazar's coffin on which Jelena embroidered her Laud to Prince Lazar, was included in the Metropolitan Museum of Art's exhibition "Byzantium: Faith and Power (1261-1557).") The focus of this paper is an *enkolpion* diptych that was originally presented to Jelena's son Uglješa Despotović on his christening day in 1367. Four years later, when Uglješa died prematurely, the mother composed a lamentation poem and had it engraved on the diptych, which now resides in the Chilandari monastery, Mount Athos, where her son is buried.

The small diptych, only 14.8 x 6.5 x 1.3 cm when open, consists of two wooden relief panels set in silver-gilt frames encrusted with pearls and semiprecious stones. The central image on the left panel represents the enthroned Virgin holding the Christ Child, set within a roundel. Smaller medallions, featuring busts of prophets, surround the central image. On the right panel, in a similar manner, the central scene of the Hospitality of Abraham is surrounded by twelve smaller medallions that frame busts of apostles. Jelena's poem, composed in Old Slavonic, is engraved on the gilded plaques that form the diptych's back.

Without altering the visual program of the diptych, Jelena Mrnjavčević introduced a new reading of it by including her poem on the icon. Originally, when the metropolitan of Serres—Teodosije (ca. 1366–after 1371) presented the diptych to the newborn prince, the themes dominating the interpretation of the iconography would have entailed the blessing bestowed on the child and his family by the ecclesiastical leader, and the unity between spiritual and secular authority. Furthermore, the visual program related to certain Orthodox doctrines and the apostolic mission of the clergy. After the child's death, Jelena's poem transformed the christening diptych into an icon of commemoration and mourning that, in a highly personal tenor, expressed the hope for spiritual salvation. Because of the various contexts in which the Chilandari diptych was employed, its iconography yields different readings. Thus it becomes evident that this work of art represents not a stagnant formulaic statement, but rather a dynamic and multi-layered set of ideas.

## "Heal Us with Your Prayer and Petition": A Pre-Iconoclastic Image of the Virgin's Dormition

## Jordan Pickett University of Pennsylvania

A number of recent Mariological studies (by I. Kalavrezou, M. Evangelatou, and B. Pentcheva, to name a few) have overlooked or ignored a relatively recent discovery by L.Y. Rahmani: in the sands of Byzantine Bet She'an, the earliest known example of the Dormition, etched on a clay token, was found in 1993. It is datable to the fifth or sixth century by virtue of its monogram and epithet for Mary, and its clay medium, which although stylistically copied in lead in the tenth century, indicates a definitively pre-Iconoclastic provenance. The Bet She'an token is 2.7 cm in diameter, and its right side is cracked, its body pared, evidence of its probable amuletic function. Despite damage over the centuries, the clay still clearly depicts a scene of mourning. A nimbed female lies supine, surrounded by four other nimbed figures, three on the left and one on the right, the latter bending towards the Virgin's feet in an abbreviated form of proskynesis, common to scenes of mourning from the Bronze Age onward. Above this scene is evidence of the frame for another figure, perhaps in a clipeata bust, while a monogram for Hagia Maria dominates the whole of the middle space. This is an exceptional arrangement for its lack of emphasis on Christ, who is present as the central figure in all other specimens of the subject. Rather than seeing the Dormition as a carefully modulated conveyance for Incarnational Christology, as has been demonstrated in the context of later Byzantine examples literally centered on Christ, our early Mariacentric prototype projects a more developed concern for devotion explicitly directed to the Virgin. This paper examines evidence for the Virgin's cult in the sixth-century Mediterranean basin, focusing especially on the multifarious early Dormition narratives and their constructions of the Incarnation, pilgrimage, healing, public and private space, mourning, and gender; these serve as variables through which analysis of their singular pre-Iconoclastic visual corollary is possible.

## THE MIRACULOUS ICON: MEDIUM, IMAGINATION AND PRESENCE

Bissera V. Pentcheva Stanford University

This paper focuses on the affair of Leo of Chalcedon (1081–1095) and the narrative of the miraculous icon of the Maria Romaia (BHG, no. 16, third quarter of the eleventh century), and explores the disconnect between image theory stressing absence and ritual practices, which enabled viewers to perceive icons as divine presence.

While the iconoclasm of the eight and ninth centuries dealt with the issue of the correct transference of likeness to matter, the Komnenian iconoclasm discussed the relationship between sacred presence and matter. The imperial position defended the earlier iconophile theory that the icon displayed absence, the imprint of visible characteristics on matter. By contrast, Leo, the leader of the opposition, argued for the icon of Christ as presence. His argument was drawn on the example of the Mandylion. He believed that the icon of Christ, by virtue of carrying the visible characteristics of his divine hypostasis (theohypostatos charakter) became presence, which then required adorational veneration (latreutikos proskynesis), while the matter on which it was imprinted—honorable veneration (timetikos proskynesis). Yet, all other icons, of Mary, the saints, and angels, whose prototypes did not have a divine hypostasis, were imprints of absence on matter, and as such they required just honorable veneration.

Leo's neat distinction between the Mandylion versus all other icons was, however, blurred in the practice of icon veneration by the general audience. A text like the narrative of the Maria Romaia icon shows just one such example of transference of the belief in presence to an icon of the Virgin. What is the reason for this Byzantine experience of icons as presence especially when the dominant theory insisted on absence? The answer lies in the documents composed during the affair of Leo of Chalcedon and more specifically the treatises of Eustratios, the bishop of Nikaia, written ca. 1111, which have never been analyzed heretofore. I will argue that in them metal emerges as the main medium of icons and that its chameleonic appearance of fleeting, temporal glitter was perceived as an exteriorization of the internal process of sensory perceptions being imprinted onto the imagination. As the visible, material equivalent to the invisible processes of the *fantasia*, the performance of the Constantinopolitan metal icons gave the impetus behind the perception of such ornate panels as animate.

### Copper Repoussé Icons: A Preliminary Report

# Ellen C. Schwartz Eastern Michigan University

This paper introduces a group of copper icons, a subset of a much larger body of base metal images I am studying. This set of images has never been amassed, let alone studied, although several scholars who dealt with individual pieces have called for such an inquiry. And while it will never be possible to create a corpus of these icons—metals were and are too useful as materials to have allowed most to survive—enough have come down to us to permit such a much-needed study. These icons of bronze and copper are made by several techniques, including repoussé and casting. The two groups are distinct, and are treated separately in this first-ever effort to scrutinize them in an indexical manner. The current paper discusses the copper icons in repoussé, dealing with them in terms of materiality, iconography, style, purpose and function within the society which made them.

These repoussé icons consist of thin sheets of copper-alloy or bronze, worked by a technique in which the forms are pushed out from behind and finished from both the back and the front. This is a time- and labor-intensive process used to produce unique images, as opposed to the casting technique which can produce multiples. The repoussé icons tend to be large by metalwork standards. Some of these pieces are very well known, like the Hodegetria in the Victoria and Albert Museum, London. Because these panels are so thin, they are fragile and often come down to us damaged. Rarely do we have the entire figure and border; a rare set are the ones on loan to the Metropolitan Museum from the Jaharis collection.

Most of the icons in the repoussé group are of very high quality. The figures exhibit good proportions and the inscriptions are clear and correct, the letters readable and elegant. Most of the icons have borders. They hint at the various purposes to which they were probably put, including as individual icons, coverings for icon beams, decoration of icon screens or doors, or perhaps as inclusions on liturgical furniture and other objects. These copper-alloy images may also be linked to the surviving precious metal images they imitate, such as the archangel Michael plaques in Venice, and to the more ubiquitous painted icons which they reflect in composition, iconography and style. The similarities in style to mid-Byzantine ivories and steatites offer striking comparisons among these groups of disparate materials worked in low relief. Despite all the references to precious materials in their appearances, however, the modest monetary worth of these bronze and copper icons can be deduced from references to them in literary sources such as monastic foundation documents. The social mileu to which they most likely belonged included the upperclass household, where they most likely would have served as icons for private prayer, decoration of modest churches and chapels and donations or bequests given to monasteries. These icons thus help to illuminate the private sphere of devotion and donation, while widening our knowledge of artistic practices in diverse media throughout middle and late Byzantine periods

# INDEX OF SPEAKERS/AUTHORS

Name	Session	Page
Anguelova, Vessela	VII	35
Argárate, Pablo		
Baboula, Eva		
Ball, Jennifer L	XI	52
Bevan, George A		
Bjeličić-Miletkov, Bojana		
Boeck, Elena N.		
Bowman, Steven	XI	53
Britt, Karen C	X	48
Cagaptay, Suna		
Caldwell, Craig H		
Caraher, William	IX	45
Caudano, Anne-Laurence	IV	21
Cline, Rangar	XVII	81
Dalgić, Örgü	XVIII	85
Dauterman Maguire, Eunice	X	50
Downing, Caroline	XVII	82
Everett, Nicholas	V	24
Fisher, Elizabeth A	V	23
Foran, Debra		
Garofeanu, Dorin	IV	20
Gibson, Craig A.		
Gray, Patrick T.R.		
Groves, Glenn		
Haldon, John	XIV	68
Hirschbichler, Monika		
Jones, Lynn		
Kaegi, Walter, E	I	4
Kalas, Veronica	XIV	66
Kalish, Kevin		
Karakaya, Nilay	VI	30

Name	Session	Page
Karem, Marina	XII	58
Kotsis, Kriszta	XVIII	87
Larison, Daniel	III	13
Leidwanger, Justin	IX	44
Lillington-Martin, Christopher		
Mayer, Wendy	VI	28
Mearns, Benjamin	XIV	67
Meredith, Hallie	XIII	62
Mihaljević, Marina	XIX	92
Moore, R. Scott	IX	45
Olster, David	I	5
Ousterhout, Robert	VI	30
Ozkaya, Yavuz	XIV	66
Papacostas, Tassos		
Papalexandrou, Amy	IX	46
Payne, Richard	XI	55
Peers, Glenn		
Pentcheva, Bissera V		
Pettegrew, David K	IX	45
Pickett, Jordan	XX	95
Prioteasa, Elena Dana	XII	59
Rapp, Claudia	III	14
Ricci, Alessandra	XVI	76
Riedel, Meredith L. D.	II	11
Romanchuk, Robert	VII	34
Santo, Matthew J. dal	XIII	63
Sarefield, Daniel	II	10
Schroeder, Rossitza B	VII	32
Schwartz, Ellen C	XX	97
Siemens, Jeremy	III	16
Sinkević, Ida	VII	33
Skedros, James C	VIII	41

Name	Session	Page
Stead, Adam	XVIII	86
Stewart, Charles A	XIX	91
Sullivan, Denis F	XIII	64
Todorov, Boris A	VII	36
Todorova, Elisaveta	XVIII	84
Torgerson, Jesse W	VIII	40
Trenchard-Smith, Margaret		
Tüskés, Anna		
Viezure, Dana-Iuliana	VIII	39
Walker, Alicia	XV	71
Whately, Conor	V	25
White, Andrew Walker		
Wickes, Jeffrey	VIII	42
Wollesen, Jens T		
Woodfin, Warren T	XV	72
Yasin, Ann Marie		

## Officers and Committees 2007-2008

Officers Lynn Jones, President, Florida State University

Amy Papalexandrou, Vice President, *University of Texas at Austin* Alicia Walker, Secretary, *Washington University in St. Louis* Anna Gonosová, Treasurer, *University of California, Irvine* 

GOVERNING To serve until the 2010 Conference

BOARD Stratis Papaioannou, Linda Safran, Adam Schor, Alicia Walker

To serve until the 2009 Conference

Sarah Bassett, Anna Gonosová, Henry Maguire, Ralph Mathisen

To serve until the 2008 Conference

Susan Boyd, Walter Hanak, Leonora Neville, Amy Papalexandrou

To serve until the 2007 Conference

John Birkenmeier, Lynn Jones, David Olster, Martha Vinson

PROGRAM Glenn Peers, CHAIR: University of Texas at Austin

COMMITTEE Patrick Gray, emeritus, York University

Geoffrey Greatex, *University of Ottawa* Kostis Kourelis, *Clemson University* 

Derek Krueger, University of North Carolina, Greensboro Antony Littlewood, emeritus, University of Western Ontario

LOCAL Linda Safran, CHAIR: University of Toronto

Arrangements Paul Denis, Royal Ontario Museum

COMMITTEE Debra Foran, University of Toronto

Tom Gallant, University of California, San Diego

Christos Hatzis, *University of Toronto* Betsy Moss, *University of Toronto* Jens Wollesen, *University of Toronto* 

Illustration: Cart Amulet, bronze, Early Christian/Byzantine. University of Toronto, Malcove Collection, M82.387, Cat. 107.